

Paper	Section	Page Number	Comments/Inputs
3- National Urban Policy	a.2 Disagreements/controversies	11	7. Designing the governance of the process of formulating, implementing and monitoring an NUP: if the NUP is to have legitimacy and to be implemented successfully, a large number of public [private and civil society actors] at all levels who will be involved in the design, implementation and M&E of an NUP must believe that the policy process is open, fair and transparent.
	d.2 List of other indicators to be taken into account	15	Other examples of indicators: Employment
	b.2 List of key priorities	20	6. Promoting a territorial and differentiated approach by [...] Particularly, empowering local governments [and communities] through [participatory] planning [...] 8. Supporting cities' actions for environmental sustainability, particularly controlling pollution [managing waste] and climate mitigation [and] adaptation.
	c. List of external factors	20	Market environment (i.e., available finance for technologies)
4 – Urban Governance, Capacity and Institutional Development	General Remarks		<p>Governance will be a keystone in the operationalisation of the New Urban Agenda. In its present form the framework lacks the structure and clarity to ensure that this important issue will prominently feature in the formulation process of the Agenda.</p> <p>The inclusion of metropolitan areas as one of three focus areas does not seem suitable, considering the preamble of the document explicitly stating that the New Urban Agenda should not only focus on larger agglomerations. Furthermore, the Policy Unit should review more governance literature to expand upon the inherent challenges, policy priorities and action-oriented recommendations. Additional literature should include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Andersson and Ostrom. 2008. Analyzing Decentralized Resource Regimes from a Polycentric Perspective. Policy Sci (41:71-93). Springer Science + Business Media, LLC. • Anguelovski and Carmin. 2011. Something borrowed, everything new: innovation and institutionalization in urban climate governance. Current Opinion in Environmental Sustainability. Elsevier B.V. • Bulkeley. 2010. Cities and the Governing of Climate Change. 35:229-53. The Annual Review of Environment and Resources.

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bulkeley and Broto. 2012. Government by experiment? Global cities and the governing of climate change. Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers. Royal Geographical Society. United Kingdom. • Corfee-Morlot, Lamia Kamal-Chaoui, et al. 2009. Cities, Climate Change and Multilevel Governance. OECD Environmental Working Papers N° 14, 2009, OECD publishing. • Ostrom, E., 2015. Governing the commons. Cambridge university press. • Ostrom, E., 2009. Understanding institutional diversity. Princeton university press. <p>Rather than reducing multi-level governance to one of three focus areas, the subject should take center stage. Rather than solely looking at metropolitan areas, the paper should examine the governance of cities as a process taking place between a polycentric constellation of actors.</p> <p>It would appear more logical if the paper was framed around [1] the key stakeholders (government agencies, NGOs, private sector, academia, etc.) as well as the challenges and opportunities they face in implementing ambitious sustainable development actions; [2] concrete measures to optimise institutional arrangements; [3] the financial, human resource and technical capacity needs to strengthen both institutions as well as interactions. Discussions pertaining to “participation and equity” – an isolated focal point in the paper at present - could be discussed within section a 1 and 2 of this revised framework.</p>
--	--	---

			<p style="text-align: center;">Multi-Governance as a meta-framework</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Fig.1 Suggested new structure of the policy paper</p>
6-Urban Spatial Strategies	1. (a) Review of the Habitat III issues papers.	2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ... (e.g. compact cities, green corridors, [transit oriented development] protection of valuable periurban land)
		3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Issue paper preceded the adoption of SDGs and in particular SDG11 [, therefore] does mention the adoption of public space as a SDG11 target.
	d. (2) List of other indicators to be taken into account	8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In addition to reviewing the SDGs beyond SDG 11, the Policy Unit should also consider examining standards such as ISO 37120.
		9	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Establish on-going monitoring systems that [are accessible to the public and] not only record progress on sustainable urban development initiatives but also identify new challenges resulting from...
	2. Spatial planning and land	12	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> With regard to the argument that revenues from land development should be shared, the Policy Unit may also wish to recognise that local governments can be driven to permitting unsustainable development (quantity as well as quality of projects), so as to

			increase budgets. (The incentive of increasing tax revenues can undermine the implementation of plans and enforcement of codes.)
	3. (a.1) Key recommendation for action.	13	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Developing innovative spatial planning and management systems [that] encompass Plan-making approaches that incorporate broad stakeholder involvement (i.e. community-level organisations, NGOs, academia, private sector, etc.) and that cut across silos within local government.
		14	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Setting up taskforces to resolve conflicts amongst neighbouring local authorities and to promote win-win strategies for comprehensive planning across administrative boundaries (i.e. transport, energy, food, etc.).
7-Urban Economic Development Strategies	1.1 Urban potential	2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Although the world's megacities are growing in number, it is important to note that over 70% of the world's population resides in small-to medium size cities and rural areas (UN-HABITAT, 2015) Nearly a billion urban inhabitants are living in slum conditions (UN-HABITAT, 2014) [...] Urban-based livelihood is [thus] a crucial means of [promoting] climate adaptation [: livelihood diversification being a key resilience strategy.]
		3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> East Asia [/Southeast Asia]
	1.2 The challenges	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Failure to generate sufficient quantity and quality of jobs and productive self-employment [large informal economies] Moving towards low-carbon growth trajectories that also promote wider development benefits
	1.3 The employment challenge	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Challenge of increasing automation leading to labor market restructuring and retrenchment of workers
		5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> People with disabilities comprise a significant percentage of informal workers
	1.4 Investment for employment	5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Levels and structure of investment [...] over the formation of human and social capital [, whilst at the same time undervaluing natural capital] Hampered by land markets: [Information deficits,] lack of clarity [...]
		6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Low investment priority in human health (health, education and skills) [and natural capital (ecosystems/ecosystem services)] Cities derive strength from connectivity, density [and diversity] Unchecked land speculation encourages developers to invest in properties that are located on the periphery of the city, contributing to urban sprawl

1.5 Competitiveness for jobs	7	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Apart from infrastructure and cost-adjusted labour skills, local [education and training policies] and regulation matter for competitiveness
1.6 Governance for employment	7	Local stakeholders in the business community, educational institutions [...] and fail to leverage each other's resources to support critical investments, [including in technical vocational education and training programs and job matching programs.] And the working poor in the informal economy, who in many cities comprise the majority of the urban workforce [face social exclusion and] are not represented in policy-making and rule-setting processes.
	8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Local governments' role and autonomy in fiscal affairs [...] than 5% of total public expenditures (Zhang 2015) [, coupled with low absorptive capacity for effectively leveraging FDI.] Many local governments are weak [...] technical [and financial] skills [for effective resource mobilization].
2.1 Introduction	10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The financing of basic services—health, education, access to [energy,] clean water [,waste management] and other utilities
2.2 Enabling markets to work	11	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Investments in urban structures— [...] Clear and enforceable land titles [based on well-developed land information systems] are important for economic development as these enable land and buildings to serve as collateral.
2.3 Infrastructure and service provision	13	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The provision of infrastructure within the city [...] Particular attention needs to be given to the transport needs of the working poor [who often face significant mobility constraints].
2.4 Urban finance	13	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Funds may come from central government [,international] or from local sources.
2.5 Visioning and land-use planning	15	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Infrastructure investments that lead, rather than lag, private development should be considered. [Public financing mechanisms supporting value capture for infrastructure such as tax-incremental financing is an instructive example.]
3.1 Introduction	17	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Agreement by international development agencies to collaborate and coordinate with local governments in the [setting of sustainability targets and in the] delivery of international development programs will be valuable too.
3.2 Specific actions in six key areas	18	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> To actively explore tripartite partnerships between the government, the private sector [,advocacy groups and] local communities of the poor in infrastructure provision.
	19	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review of building and land-use regulation with a view to encouraging density, connectedness and [maintenance of environmental resources in] the transition towards a low-carbon economy and society.

	3.3 Indicators of successful implementation, monitoring and evaluation	20	Structural: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Commuter adjusted population figures • Jobs-to-housing balance index
	3.4 Analysing financial resources required and instruments for their availability	21	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Total investment in economic infrastructure—power, transport, telecommunication and water [,waste] and sanitation [...]
8- Urban Ecology and Resilience	Key concepts	3	Resilience [...] More usually in relation to urban systems, it refers to the potential for individuals, communities and ecosystems to [respond and] recover from a range of shocks and stresses.
	1. Challenges	4	vi. The city will harness [, to the greatest extent possible] the available potential of [distributed] renewable energy [systems and advanced metering grids] to meet growing demands in an environmentally-sustainable, cost-effective and secure manner.
	a. Review of the Habitat III issues papers	5	The SDGs explicitly address [...] poverty reduction, [waste and] water management, and resilient infrastructure.
	b. Review / analysis of key publications / documents	6	1.b.1 Governance ii. Limited decentralization and lack of empowerment of local authorities and local communities [, including social exclusion of the most poor]. 1.b.2 Policy ii. Lack of integration of policy issues such as environmental management, [climate change, energy], urban health, [...] iii. Policies limited in scope, non-inclusive [...] (e.g. with women and other marginalized groups, [such as people with disabilities].) 1.b.3 Capacity vi. Knowledge deficits in preparing tender and contract documents 1.b.4 Planning viii. Geographical vulnerability of low-income communities
	c. Identify examples, projects, practices	8	Fundamentally there is diversity between cities in terms of urban landscapes, [accessibility], land uses, land tenure [...]

	2. Priorities a. Establish criteria for identifying policy priorities	10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Affordability
	b. Define key transformations to achieve by policy priorities	10	<p>2.b.1 Governance ii. Environmental, climate, and disaster risk management should be integrated [...] transformative change to occur at the individual, [household], corporate, neighbourhood, [...]</p> <p>2.b.2 Policy i. Policies for resilience of cities should be refined specifically to the place [...] disaster risk management, economic, and social objectives [including potential co-benefits, such as employment]; consider [...] ii. Governments and policymakers should be more explicit about climate change adaptation [...] already been damaged [, whilst seeking synergies with mitigation approaches].</p>
		11	<p>2.b.3 Capacity i. Build capacity, knowledge and instruments for [...] reduction of [enhancing] resilience viii. Invest in the capacity of marginalised groups (e.g. women, indigenous people [, people with disabilities]) to influence the formulation [...]</p>
		12	<p>2.b.4 Planning iii. Good urban form should consider [density,] accessibility and zones based on [...]</p>
	3. Implementation a. Identify key actions at all levels of implementation	16	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Make use of information-based approaches to raise awareness about the utility of urban interventions
9-Urban Services and Technology	3. Implementation a. Urban infrastructure and basic services including energy	12/13	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Waste management <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Establish a balance of decentralized waste management systems [which emphasize waste prevention/source separation with a view towards wider socioeconomic development.] - Facilitate urban mining and the reuse [of wastes; establish material recovery facilities] - Promote market development to support the valorization of waste and waste products

	Water and Sanitation	13/14	- Improve existing water distribution network to prevent the occurrence of non-revenue water
	Energy		- Consider increasingly different energy aspects jointly, as heat and electricity supply in conjunction with mobility; [waste-to-energy]
	Key actions at all levels of implementation b. Transport and Mobility	16	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • National governments - Establish vehicles standards and regulations (e.g. fuel taxes, [fuel efficiency standards])
	Conclusion	18	2. To develop local economies that sustain processes of social production [, preservation] of habitat and community development;