HUAIROU COMMISSION
Women, Homes & Community

Comments on the Habitat III Issue Papers from the Huairou Commission and its Network Members

In recent decades, urbanization has led the way for women's issues to emerge at the forefront of multilateral and donor agendas. Yet challenges remain as civil society prepares to offer formal input into the process leading up to next year's Habitat III conference and its intended outcome, the New Urban Agenda. One particular challenge is what an agenda for women will look like.

The Habitat II conference saw unprecedented attention given to women, and the outcome document remains overall as one of the strongest of any U. N. conference. Emerging themes at the time were critical for women, including the problem of uncoordinated urban development, the lack of employment, the need for health and educational facilities, and insecurity and poverty. Strikingly, these issues remain prevalent in cities and human settlements today, particularly for women. This is because the Habitat II priorities, though strong on paper, failed to be implemented in practice.

We have a critical opportunity between now and next year's Habitat III conference. The Habitat Agenda continues to call forth many of the key points that came out of the 1996 conference in Istanbul: Gender-specific poverty remains in urban areas, as does a lack of employment, health services, and educational facilities. These issues are not new to the Huairou Commission's network members and grassroots women partners. Indeed, grassroots women living and working in poor and marginal communities—regardless of locality— are often the primary caregivers for their families; they are the community members most frequently accessing basic services like water, health, and sanitation. Frequently composing the majority of groups organized to fill gaps left by the absence of public or private services, grassroots women pool their labor to improve the quality of life for their families and neighborhoods.

Furthermore, grassroots women leaders representing community-based/self-help organizations can be found "donating" their time to participate in municipal planning, settlement upgrading, and budget allocation bodies to ensure development investments reach them and reflect their priorities. Even so, due to traditional gender and power relations, women are often unable to take advantage of decentralized decision-making or participatory budgeting, and cannot effectively engage with local authorities as empowered constituencies or partners.

For these reasons, it is critical that the Habitat III Issue Papers – the departing point for the important work of the Policy Units – reflect a gender perspective. We at the Huairou Commission found the Issue Papers to broadly cover a range of issues, but lack an overall gendered approach. Scarce mention of the words 'women' and 'gender' prompted the preoccupation that women and gender would not be well accounted for within the input documents

to the New Urban Agenda. We thus compiled a number of responses from our network members, which can be found within this document.

<u>Comments on the Habitat III Issue Papers from the Huairou Commission and its Network Members</u>

Issue Paper 1: Inclusive cities

A. Issues missing from the paper which need to be added, particularly related to women

Margaret Shaw, Women in Cities International
Gender is mainstreamed much more in this paper than in Paper No. 3 on safe cities.
Both gender and empowerment are key words. Nevertheless, there could be discussion
right from the start of the differential impacts of exclusion in cities on women -
their greater vulnerability than men.

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
The paper is weak on the drivers of change that will secure the empowerment of women.
With the exception of the mention of the leverage that can be applied by the human
rights-based approach, the paper relies on the voluntary adoption by governments of
inclusive approaches. In situations of entrenched political power wielded by
deliberately exclusionary elites this is naive. The linkages between securing
inclusive forms of urban governance, empowering women (especially grassroots women)
and socio-economic development are neglected.
It is weak on the livelihoods aspects of women's empowerment.
It does not address the strategic and tactical options for pursuing inclusion or
enhancing the role of women.

Anne M. Kaltenborn Lunde, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
Emphasis on women as city changers and resource persons with knowledge and abilities
to find sustainable solutions on all levels of society, and to participate in
planning and development
Human rights as a basis for the theme of this paper, i.a. access to all rights for
women and non-discrimination
Legal system and common law regarding empowering of women
Emphasis on the "new" opportunities for women to break out of "cultural bondage" due
to urbanization

Josephine Castillo, DAMPA Federation (The Philippines)
In the key drivers for action, there is a lack of responsibility of national and
regional governments, of requirements, and of a holistic approach.

Elsa María Arroyo Hernández, Mujeres, Democracia y Ciudadanía A.C.
Alma Margarita Oceguera Rodríguez, OSC Centro Cultural Esperanza Rodríguez, A.C.
• Human rights with a gender perspective
• Transparency and accountability with PEG.
• Governance with a focus on gender, collaboration, and sustainability; Dialogue with
social partners and sectors of civil society, academics, private and public
interests.
• That of nondiscrimination.
• All international and local norms and determining the care and protection of the
environment and living beings as well as updates on legislation linked to ecological
plans, Atlas Venture, Land Use Law, Construction Law, Law of Ecological Balance,
among others. This noncompliance of these laws impacts society in general and, to a
greater extent, women and mainly the economically precarious social classes.
• It doesn't highlight the relationship between gender equality, empowerment of women
and development as positive drivers of the New Urban Agenda

• Women as agents of change within rural and urban areas
• The ability of women to transform their environments
• Economic empowerment, women do not need disinfection of urban and rural land but rather social, cultural and economic resources
• The civil right of women to live free from violence and conditions to equality, recognizing that violence affects women at a higher level, in both private and in public spaces, it impacts the free exercise of their citizenship and is a limit to their freedom and thus cause for exclusion."

B. Major points (good and bad) that relate to women

Margaret Shaw, Women in Cities International
Good that there is brief mention of the interrelationship between gender and other factors such as age, ethnicity, etc. (p.2) and the links between economic and spatial inequality and gender inequality (p.3).
Good discussion on women living below the poverty line and the multiple ways they are affected.
Section B has a good and gendered discussion of participation and innovation and the importance of voices and community participation.

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
The paper is scrupulous in positioning poor women as the victims of political and economic socio-economic processes. It is correct in identifying opportunities for urban women to break away from conservative rural gender norms.
Its weaker aspects are in seeing women largely as victims and not as agents of change and improvement. Mention is made of the benefits of collective action organisations of poor urban women, but only in a very general way with little attention to areas in which they may have particular influence.

Anne M. Kaltenborn Lunde, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
An important item is that women are mentioned in general as one of many marginalized groups and without any distinctions as to what groups of women and "disappearing in the crowd of all the "groups" mentioned". Much more distinctions needed and more characteristics of the various "groups" mentioned.
It is as well wrong to mention the other "groups" without any distinctions - only some in each group may be marginalized and different systems/attitudes in different countries.

Josephine Castillo, DAMPA Federation (The Philippines)
There is not enough focus on women, only mention women in the 'key drivers' but not in the issues section.

Elsa María Arroyo Hernández, Mujeres, Democracia y Ciudadanía A.C.
Alma Margarita Oceguera Rodríguez, OSC Centro Cultural Esperanza Rodríguez, A.C.
Good:
• Recognition that the majority of the poor population in urban and rural zones is women and their access to public services (such as health, education, employment, etc.) is deficient

• Recognition that economic inequality is closely related to gender inequality and spatial inequality, leading to exclusion and often criminalization of disadvantaged and vulnerable groups.
Bad:
• Plants urbanization as a panacea to eradicate evils and to disown the worldview of indigenous or ethnic groups living in rural areas in harmony with their environment coexisting with deep respect for nature.
• Ignores that violence in urban areas mainly affects women and generates specific phenomena such as femicide and the disappearance of women and girls, making them invisible to speak of complex phenomena.
• Women are considered as part of vulnerable groups rather than rural and half urban populations

C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Margaret Shaw, Women in Cities International
Good discussion on the drivers of exclusion p.4-5 (even if a little generic).
Strong support for participatory approaches.
Discussion on the benefits but also problems which can be associated with decentralization of power to the local government level.

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
The paper makes it clear that that gender equality perspectives should, be mainstreamed into all decisions around budgeting, infrastructure investments, and land-use and that collective action by women's organizations and are highly effective in addressing key urban challenges and negotiating with other stakeholders like government or private land owners.

Anne M. Kaltenborn Lunde, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
Cities as engines for growth and more possibilities for women to acquire new types of jobs, more participation etc., ref above
Progressive cities recognize inclusion as a prerequisite
Pro-active strategies to engage organizations in urban policy and planning
Inclusion of young people in decision-making

Elsa María Arroyo Hernández, Mujeres, Democracia y Ciudadanía A.C.
Alma Margarita Oceguera Rodríguez, OSC Centro Cultural Esperanza Rodríguez, A.C.
The inclusion of a gender perspective in shaping the New Urban Agenda and therefore a favorable urban environment for the diversity of women and men.
Analysis from the perspective of human rights with a gender perspective.
It is mentioned but lacks a vision of human rights with a gender perspective and therefore it does not deepen the analysis of gender gaps faced by women in urban and rural areas.

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board

The paper is relevant to poor women - whom it is assumed are grassroots women - as it frequently mentions them as particular victims of exclusive processes. It therefore clearly locates them on the development agenda. What it does not do is address the systemic rather than voluntaristic measures that will ensure that are placed at the heart of the development process.

Anne M. Kaltenborn Lunde, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
Relevance where mentioned pro-active strategies to engage org. in urban policy and planning.
Possibly relevant for some grassroots women's organizations when mentioning of support for unregistered and informal migrants.
Lack of mentioning the knowledge and experiences of grassroots women and the many positive experiences of grassroots women organizing and running local community activities, and cooperation etc. with local authorities and others.

Josephine Castillo, DAMPA Federation (The Philippines)
Proactive strategies & economic equalities only

Elsa María Arroyo Hernández, Mujeres, Democracia y Ciudadanía A.C.
Alma Margarita Oceguera Rodríguez, OSC Centro Cultural Esperanza Rodríguez, A.C.
The implementation of a human rights approach with a gender perspective in hand with a corresponding legislative harmonization, ensures that the diversity of women and men, young girls and boys, means that you can have an environment (natural environment, housing, city, country, world) that counts upon the organization of public services for a better life for everyone, according to their needs and particularities; bearing all this in mind, in the planning and construction in their land use and so on. This, associated with the production, development, access to services, employment, economy, etc., internal to local, municipal, state and national levels, in correspondence and/or consideration of its geography and natural resources. In that sense, being mainly grassroots women surviving in the urban and rural areas, this work should be an opportunity to enhance and enable a holistic, comprehensive view strengthening the role of women in general and in particular, of grassroots women active in their own development and design of inclusive cities and the rethinking of existing ones.

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Margaret Shaw, Women in Cities International
Useful paper because it incorporates considerable discussion of gender.

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
It establishes a platform for pursuing a gendered perspective, but does not go far enough in going beyond conventional analyses in the "Pathways" section in developing mechanisms or entry points for change.

Anne M. Kaltenborn Lunde, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
Too weak, should be much more on women in general and grassroots women's organizations and more emphasis on the need to involve women in all spheres of activities.

More distinctions and descriptions of/ between the "groups" mentioned and the different means needed to improve the living conditions of the various groups.

Josephine Castillo, DAMPA Federation (The Philippines)
Not very well- women are clustered with the rest of minorities. The paper needs to be more specific.

Elsa María Arroyo Hernández, Mujeres, Democracia y Ciudadanía A.C.
Alma Margarita Oceguera Rodríguez, OSC Centro Cultural Esperanza Rodríguez, A.C.
Mexico does not yet offer to its population cities that are inclusive, smart, secure, and with universal access to services, etc. The gender issue is the opportunity to do so, as it is essential for the incorporation of human rights with a gender perspective. This new paradigm requires a rethinking and reformulation of the new challenges facing humanity, our answers, as well as the planning, design, budget, governance, city building, and so on. The gender perspective impacts society as a whole, to the diversity of women and men, and realizes how we live differently in territories. As a methodological and measurement tool, it has demonstrated huge deficits of insecurity and violence for women in general and particularly for the economically vulnerable social classes. The planning and construction of cities in Mexico, as yet does not reflect the principles of quality of life, good practices and good living, as a condition and irreplaceable elements for planning inclusive, safe, intelligent, green, cultural, self-sustaining cities.
In taking the voice of those who live and walk in territories sharply divided into urban and rural areas, they may adapt and improve cities, reflected in a better life for women and men.

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Margaret Shaw, Women in Cities International
Could give examples from the multitude of women's projects in Section 5.
In the Platform/Reference section at the end of the paper, should include a number of the platforms and studies/projects listed in Issue Paper 3 on Safer Cities and those additionally suggested in my comments on that Paper vis. Red Muher y Habitat and Women in Cities International, and the UN Women Global Programme on Safer Cities for Women and Girls.

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
The paper is generally weak on the political economy of exclusion. It neglects to mention how the concept of governance has been captured by emerging elites to further their own interests with the result of increasing exclusion in a number of instances. It fails to ask why cities fail to adopt the measures that are recommended if the benefits are so obvious. What other ideas are out there, for example, those associated with the "World Class City", that prove more attractive to some city administrations.

Anne M. Kaltenborn Lunde, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
I wonder if it is possible to refer to some of the other issue papers, to refer to the connection between the aspects and means to achieve the goal of an inclusive city

(probably too long but now all these issue papers may be seem to stand on its own without reference to other aspects?)

Josephine Castillo, DAMPA Federation (The Philippines)
The issues in relation to women are not narrowed down.

Elsa María Arroyo Hernández, Mujeres, Democracia y Ciudadanía A.C.
Alma Margarita Oceguera Rodríguez, OSC Centro Cultural Esperanza Rodríguez, A.C.
It allows an overview of what an inclusive city should be in every way, however, is not a holistic vision of inclusion and good living. It neglects macroeconomic and cultural practices, efficient and sufficient access to public services, amusement and entertainment that directly affects the improvement or deterioration of the living conditions of its inhabitants and therefore of the spaces they inhabit. As such, by not implementing from a vision of human rights with a gender perspective, based on the aforementioned triad (quality of life, good practices and good living), it does not address the serious conflicts of interest and corruption that subject and sacrifice the design and the objectives of building inclusive cities. Similarly, it does not implement a mechanism of transparency, accountability, evaluation and improvement.

G. General suggestions and commentary

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
The paper is written in general terms and provides little in the way of regional differentiation. There are different trends in different regions. Little attention has been paid to success stories where things have improved. It provides a rather static analysis and does little to identify the most recent dynamics that can address exclusion, for example, the impact of increasing use of ICT by poor women.

Veronica Katulushi, Zambia Homeless and Poor People's Federation
All persons in the cities should have the right to the city Free of discrimination based on 'Gender'
-The right to the city is therefore, far more than a right of individual or Group access to the cities' resources that the city embodies: It is a right to change and reinvent the city more after our heart desire.
-It is moreover, a collective rather than an individual right, since changing the city depends upon the exercise of a collective power over the process of developing a city.

Anne M. Kaltenborn Lunde, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
I think that relevant strategies for access to rights and better living conditions for women are to be found in the Habitat Agenda, page 29 and some relevant aspects on page 56 - 59.

Josephine Castillo, DAMPA Federation (The Philippines)
Glosses over several groups but does not detail their specific needs and issues, especially in relation to gender.

Elsa María Arroyo Hernández, Mujeres, Democracia y Ciudadanía A.C.

Alma Margarita Oceguera Rodríguez, OSC Centro Cultural Esperanza Rodríguez, A.C.
The model of development and urbanization in the 21st century has an urgent
responsibility to the entire population to improve and progress in cities and to make
visible inclusive, civic and democratic spaces and structures. Gender mainstreaming
is a tool that has brought awareness in the construction of intelligent, inclusive,
and safe cities, with friendly spaces for all living beings, such as experiences of
very small little-known communities or in model countries counting upon social
welfare and human development, like the Nordic countries.
Today human rights with a gender perspective is a committed approach to the diversity
of women and men that populate the world. This project may be an original
contribution in a global context where new challenges present multiple obstacles to
security, public policy, social, economic and cultural collaboration and best
practice approaches.
The growth of population and poverty in Mexico are results which come from the
experience and knowledge of neighborhoods, cities and nations, and which today count
upon cities that are inclusive, smart, secure, flexible and with universal access to
services. The gender perspective has played a leading role in the transition to
models of cities with participatory communities with mechanisms for democratic
governance through participatory instruments that make effective the results and the
product of the work of public administration in the cities construction.
The reformulation of the concepts and practices to build a city that gives and / or
responds to each of the challenges, on the premise that the privileges of
urbanization correspond to the entire population with equal opportunities.
An inclusive city supports a reflection based on decisions that allow it to become
that city in which anyone, that is, everyone can live having universal access to all
public services, where their environment is safe and friendly and it allows you to
develop your skills, nurture their creativity and encourage social, economic and
cultural common interests with solidarity and responsible sense.
Issue Paper 2: Migration and refugees in urban areas

    A. Issues missing from the paper which need to be added, particularly related to
       women

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori
The paper does not even mention the issue of gender and migration having specific
implications. While the paper deals with the rights of migrants and refugees and
addresses these rights from a framework of human rights, more specific
vulnerabilities such as gender are not spoken about. More particularly, trafficking
if persons is not addressed and needs to be brought into the ambit of the paper.

Joyce Nangobi, Slum Women's Initiative for Development (Uganda)
Most vulnerable groups should be highlighted including, women, children, the disabled
and elderly.

    B. Major points (good and bad) that relate to women

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori
Does not talk about women.

Joyce Nangobi, Slum Women's Initiative for Development (Uganda)
The process through which women go through to secure legal document to enable them freely move is so stressing.

C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori
Though there is no mention specifically of gender, the paper has many ideas that could be beneficial to women include the emphasis on human rights and protecting the rights of migrants and refugees. It also talks about practical approaches to addressing the needs of migrants and the importance of seeing them as part of the city and not building parallel services and institutions for them.

Joyce Nangobi, Slum Women's Initiative for Development (Uganda)
The policy (UNHCR policy on alternatives to camps) promotes sustainable operational approaches that build upon the resources and capacities of refugees (women) and promote refugees to promote synergies with national and local development, infrastructure and service delivery systems.

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori
The paper talks about how migrants and refugees need to made part of the mainstream and this is relevant to grassroots women and it seeks to engage these vulnerable sections of people to become part of the society. Further it talks about irregular migrants and their particular vulnerabilities which need to be dealt with. It talks about planning for urban disaster risk reduction.

Joyce Nangobi, Slum Women's Initiative for Development (Uganda)
Human rights agencies and governments have come out to dialogue on the issues pertaining migrants and refugees.

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori
The paper has a strong focus on the human rights of migrants and refugees. It also talks about integration and of how urban planning must engage in 'placemaking' and ensure that the needs of diverse groups are taken care of. Further the duty of the State to protect rights is strongly emphasised.

Joyce Nangobi, Slum Women's Initiative for Development (Uganda)
Urban authorities should adopt a resilient model to accommodate migrants and refugees when need arises. This will promote economic development and human rights sustainability in the new sustainable development goals frame work.
Reinforcing the principle of the urban refugee policy that seeks to move away from the traditional camp based operational response and create possibilities for refugees

to live lawfully, peacefully and independently in communities with the ability to take responsibility for the own lives and families.

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Joyce Nangobi, Slum Women's Initiative for Development (Uganda)
The paper has highlighted on key issues to be implemented but, Legal restrictions and social, economic and racial discrimination often impact negatively on the ability of migrants of which the authorities should seriously put into consideration.
While contributing to innovation that fuels urban centers. Migrants and refugees can become key players in city development, growth, resilience and sustainability as bridges between destinations and origin cities, with skills and resources and acting as transactional traders, business partners, philanthropists and investors.
It has generalized in most of its focus not mentioning the most affected parties to give weight to the discrimination that is mentioned.

G. General suggestions and commentary

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori
The omission of gender is a problem as we know that a large percentage of the world's migrants are women and they have specific vulnerabilities including to sexual abuse and violence. Further the issue of women's migration for the work of care all over and the abuses that they are vulnerable to need to be incorporated into the paper.

Joyce Nangobi, Slum Women's Initiative for Development (Uganda)
The paper should also serve to benefit the hosts of migrants or refugees. In some cases refugees cause chaos in the hosting country or countries.

Veronica Katulushi, Zambia Homeless and Poor People's Federation
They should be participatory: Everyone should be involved in formulating, planning, designing and implementing their National policies especially the vulnerable and marginalized groups in society such as women, the disabled, etc: their voices should be heard especially the "grassroots women."

Issue Paper 3: Safer Cities

A. Issues missing from the paper which need to be added, particularly related to women

Margaret Shaw, Women in Cities International
The paper is generally pitched at an abstract or generic level with a focus on how to create safer cities - the social and economic benefits, recent evidence and

experiences, the approach to implementing safer cities plans, the role of governments, both national and local etc. in line with UN Guidelines.
Gender is not mainstreamed in the paper - these are generic citizens not gendered citizens.
Gender should be there from the beginning including: as a Key Word; and referenced in the Key Concepts eg. especially under social capital, crime prevention and urban safety.
Under Key Facts & Figures there should be reference to far more than the UN Women study - and to more than issues of VAW in public spaces ie. to the differential impacts of crime and violence and fear on women and girls compared with men and boys; to differential gender issues in public transport, in housing and tenure, access to essential services such as water and sanitation, migrant women etc.
Gender should be discussed throughout the Issue Summary section of the paper..
There needs to be specific discussion of the importance of compiling disaggregated statistics on males and females, as well as age etc. and not just limiting the point (p. 3) to disaggregated data collection."

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori (India)
By and large this paper does have a decent gender focus. What could be added is the role that communities and grassroots women could have in terms of building safer communities. But it talks about the role of civil society, importance in engaging a wide range of stakeholders. It could also mention specific vulnerabilities that women face such as age, poverty, disability, migrant status.

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
I barely know where to start in enumerating the missing issues. This is not so much because issues are not addressed but because of the excessive comprehensiveness of the approach. It is is unstrategic without any actions being identified as particularly pivotal. Everything should be tackled. In many capacity-deprived developing country cities this is just not possible.
What I mainly missed from the paper is the role of women as actors in the process of creating safer cities.
The role of women as perpetrators of crime, as opposed to being the victims of insecurity, is not explored.

Olga Segovia, Red Mujer y Habitat America Latina
Mainly it does not sufficiently consider the importance of the participation and leadership of women in the development of diagnostics and proposals for greater security and better living in the city.
It also does not appear conceptual references and statistical information generated by organizations and expert networks in the field.
Therefore, is necessary to incorporate more conceptual and methodological reflection and empirical information.

Anne M. Kaltenborn Lunde, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
More emphasis on women being particularly victims of violence, crimes and unsafe physical surroundings, also should be mentioned the difficult situation for women and girls in conflict areas.
More mentioning of the particularly difficult/unsafe conditions in slum areas.
No mentioning of disaggregated data on gender re lack of safety.

Margaret Shaw, Women in Cities International
Primarily the discussion refers to VAW in public spaces which is good, but not sufficient as indicated above.
The 4th bullet point under Knowledge (p.5) is good and directly relevant to women but again limited to sexual violence in public spaces. There is no discussion of harassment as part of the spectrum of gendered behaviour which affects women living in the city. Because the daily roles of men and women in many cities/countries differ the greater exposure of women and girls to harassment and violence needs to be spelt out.

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori (India)
The paper has a fairly good understanding of gender dimensions of urban safety. It talks about how women feel less safe in cities than men; the gendered nature of violence in public spaces; and the role of women in creating safety in cities.

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
Women as mentioned as those who suffer the consequences of a lack of safety. This is OK. But they are largely located as beneficiaries of larger processes rather as actors that can act independently. Women are "consulted" once participation processes are in place, which is acceptable, but it is not enough.

Olga Segovia, Red Mujer y Habitat America Latina
A positive point in this document points out the need for cooperation and partnership between governments, grassroots and NGOs. The downside is a lack of gender mainstreaming in the proposal.

Anne M. Kaltenborn Lunde, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
Important that the document mentions cooperation between authorities and local groups to improve/solve the problems of safety and crime prevention.
There should be much more mentioning of important work done by grassroots org and grassroots women organizations on how to improve the conditions, and also many examples of cooperation between authorities and local groups. Some references to bottom-up experiences.

C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Margaret Shaw, Women in Cities International
That women (and girls) are exposed to gender violence in public spaces. That participatory approaches and empowering approaches are essential and that cities need to enable citizen empowerment and meaningful participation.
That urban planning and design must take account of gender.
That cities should invest in slum upgrading and use innovative proactive financing and investment to reduce social and economic inequalities.
That the rule of law, human rights and the right to the city for all should be basic principles for developing safer cities.

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori (India)
There are several ideas in this paper that are relevant to women's lives and concerns.
1. The need to include diverse voices in the safer cities debates.
2. How gender affects the experience of the city.
3. The role that social media and technology can play in addressing social issues
4. How the safer cities discourse engages with urban planning and governance.

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
The document mentions that experience of insecurity is gendered, and that women have different priorities to men. Also, the paper stresses exclusion rather than poverty per se as being important, which is essential to understanding women's experience of insecurity.

Olga Segovia, Red Mujer y Habitat America Latina
The document notes that women are more likely to be victims of some kind of crimes like rape and sexual harassment. As a result, women worldwide tent to feel less safe than man in the cities

Anne M. Kaltenborn Lunde, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
Involvement of civil society organizations in planning, decision making and performing to improve safety and crime reduction.

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Margaret Shaw, Women in Cities International
It is very relevant to the lives of the many women and girls living in under-serviced and disadvantaged neighbourhoods in millions of cities. They are more likely to be living in such conditions than men, and often more vulnerable to violence and exploitation than men.

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori (India)
Women as social actors in urban spaces is central. This paper discussed concerns that are important to grassroots women - resilience, innovation, crime prevention and city leadership. Grassroots women have an important contribution to all these aspects of building safer cities. It also mentions the importance of creating safe and efficient transport as part of an urban safety agenda. It also talks about the trends of urbanization and increasing violence and how economic inequality rather than poverty is a key factor in urban safety and growing insecurity and lack of safety.

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
It is not particularly relevant to grassroots women. It concentrates on systemic change at government and city level rather than on what grassroots women can do themselves.

Olga Segovia, Red Mujer y Habitat America Latina
It is highlighted that empowerment and citizen participation are relevant for safer cities.

Design and urban planning can definitely contribute to social integration and greater diversity including gender and age.

Anne M. Kaltenborn Lunde, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
Very relevant and important to grassroots women

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Margaret Shaw, Women in Cities International
It needs to be more firmly gendered throughout.

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori (India)
This paper definitely feeds into engendering the New Urban Agenda as it dwells two aspects - how women experience cities and the gendered nature of violence; and secondly the role that women can play in creating more gender inclusive cities. Further the focus on the importance of a diversity of stakeholders in building safer urban spaces recognizes the centrality of partnership building.

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
There is not much that is new in it with regard to the gender aspects of safer cities.

Olga Segovia, Red Mujer y Habitat America Latina
Safer cities are very important for grassroots women. Therefore, is important to highlight and expand their role in generation actions.

Anne M. Kaltenborn Lunde, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
By emphasizing bottom-up experiences by grassroots women and cooperation between local and national authorities and civil society groups.

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Margaret Shaw, Women in Cities International
This is an important paper on an important topic which reflects the huge evolution of understanding and action around crime prevention and promoting safety in cities, rather than relying only on the criminal justice system after the fact.

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori (India)
The paper is strong in its analysis of the reasons that cause urban insecurity including growing economic disparity; spatial segregation into gated communities and slums; the role of small arms; and the gendered nature of violence. It also talks about a range of strategies from reducing recidivism, safety audits, inclusive urban planning and local crime prevention strategies that are multi stakeholder. With the recognition that majority of the perpetrators of violence are young men as mentioned in the paper should result in strategies to engage young men and seek out solutions.

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board

The strength of the paper is that it makes connections with other themes that are addressed in other issues papers such as governance and exclusion. The weaknesses of the paper have already been mentioned.

Olga Segovia, Red Mujer y Habitat America Latina
Incorporating a gender perspective in the analysis and proposals. Stressing the role of women's organizations.

G. General suggestions and commentary

Margaret Shaw, Women in Cities International
Additions to the Platforms and Projects section which help to illustrate the gender dimensions of safe cities: notably the work/websites of Red Mujer y Habitat, and Women in Cities International (WICI), and major projects such as the Gender Inclusive Cities Project (WICI -UN Trust Fund) and Living Together: Cities Free of Violence against Women. Women's safety is a movement and one which UN Habitat itself has played a major role in.

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori (India)
The paper talks about local and national government actions as complementary to each other. This idea of roles of different stakeholders needs to be fleshed out a bit more. The nature of growth of inequality within cities is a key aspect of urban development. Cities that develop more equitably can be major vehicles of growth. Economic empowerment is key to growth of cities and violence, crime and fear all play an important role in sustainable development. This can be further developed. Urban safety needs to be seen as an essential aspect of sustainable urbanisation.

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
Although the paper makes mention of notions such as resilience and social capital in the introductory paragraphs it does not really carry these themes into the following text in a consistent way. There is no summary at the beginning which provides a succinct and easy to understand explanation of theme that allow the reader to navigate through the blizzard of words, multi-clause sentences and long paragraphs that follow.
There should be more conclusions drawn from practical experiences rather than general theory, particularly drawing from UN-Habitat's own activities in creating safer cities. Evidence should be given that a safer cities approach actually works for the population in general and women in particular. The examples quoted - Durban, New York - are pretty dated now.

Olga Segovia, Red Mujer y Habitat America Latina
Add in platforms and projects:
- Observatory Cities, Violence & Gender: http://www.ciudadesygenero.org/
- Project: "Colombia, Chile, El Salvador: A new step in implementing policies against violence, with police actors.
- Women safer: http://mujeresmasseguras.sitiosur.cl/
- Experiences Map: Women's Organizations and Police Cast: Contributing to eradicate gender violence: http://www.mapadeexperiencias.sitiosur.cl/

Anne M. Kaltenborn Lunde, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
With so many references and research already carried out, someone might start setting
up a more concrete list of activities, measures etc to use, but with more emphasis on
grassroots women and women`s participation, decision-making and empowerment.
Specifically dealing with conditions in slums, and more emphasis also on conditions
in conflict areas.

Issue Paper 4: Urban Culture and Heritage

A. Issues missing from the paper which need to be added, particularly related to women

Fabiola Teresa Vargas Valencia, Comisión Ciudadana de Derechos Humanos del Noroeste – CCDH (Mexico)
Two topics are absent, the culture of environmental preservation and political culture. In the latter, the political participation of women in Latin American cities is critical.

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori (India)
The paper completely misses discussing issues related to women. There needs to be discussion around how strengthening culture and heritage promotes not only inclusion but also how it promotes gendered inclusion. Further the paper makes no mention about how the processes of cultural erosion affect women's lives, livelihoods and identities.

B. Major points (good and bad) that relate to women

Fabiola Teresa Vargas Valencia, Comisión Ciudadana de Derechos Humanos del Noroeste – CCDH (Mexico)
The points are presented in a broad and general manner, like art, cultural industry, the city, economic and cultural heritage, etc. However, in discussing cultural practices and local knowledge, mentioned is the idea of developing training programs for artists and cultural professionals, aimed at women and young people.

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori (India)
Since the paper does not discuss gender or women's relationship to cities, culture and urban heritage, all these need to be further explored.

C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Fabiola Teresa Vargas Valencia, Comisión Ciudadana de Derechos Humanos del Noroeste – CCDH (Mexico)
The key ideas that benefit women are not developed in the document.

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori (India)
It would be very useful to have a gendered analysis of the processes of building creative cities; how women relate to heritage and environment and impacts of increased tourism on women. The paper also talks of spatial segregation and it would be important the gender implications of such processes. Also women play an important role in transmission of culture and this needs to be explored further.

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Fabiola Teresa Vargas Valencia, Comisión Ciudadana de Derechos Humanos del Noroeste – CCDH (Mexico)
It is the search for the identity of the cities through culture and re-humanization, the proposed inclusive city. Social fabric care, democratization, social cohesion through culturally-engaged governance.

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori (India)
This paper has great relevance to grassroots women as it discusses urban cultures and how they impact living. For example it mentions the impact of core historical city areas which are dense, multi-use and diverse. Such spaces promote active interaction among people and create a positive urban atmosphere. The role of grassroots women and impact on them would be useful to understand. Also it explores the possible marginalization of alternative and non-mainstream cultures.

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Fabiola Teresa Vargas Valencia, Comisión Ciudadana de Derechos Humanos del Noroeste – CCDH (Mexico)
Grassroots women are absent, even though there is talk of participation, the social subjects and their action are not defined. The condition of poverty is mentioned.

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori (India)
This paper fits well into the New Urban Agenda as it has taken up the very crucial issue of how culture and cultural practices are central to creating cohesive societies. Safeguarding heritage is discussed and this plays a role in defining cities. Small and medium sized cities in developing countries also have the potential to develop and become vibrant cities.

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Fabiola Teresa Vargas Valencia, Comisión Ciudadana de Derechos Humanos del Noroeste – CCDH (Mexico)
The strength is that the document represents the macro reference of the notion of urban culture and heritage, but does not develop the action, practices, or participation of social actors, including women.

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori (India)
Overall it is a good paper as it brings centre stage an issue that is not always discussed while discussing cities - that of culture and heritage. All cities have their history and heritage which needs to be fostered and strengthened and it is positive that Habitat III chooses to give it priority. It also talks about how sometimes processes like globalisation can weaken cultures and traditions and these need to be safeguarded. What is missing is an analysis of the role that technologies and ICT's can play in this process.

G. General suggestions and commentary

Fabiola Teresa Vargas Valencia, Comisión Ciudadana de Derechos Humanos del Noroeste – CCDH (Mexico)
The document on urban culture and heritage does not include the mainstreaming of gender and equality. It constitutes a view from the general to the particular, losing the relevance of people as managers and builders of cities, and in this way the right to the city is not visible.
I suggest that the paper address issues of diversity, inclusion, social cohesion, democracy, etc. It emphasizes social actors, as assets, historical and reflective subjects.

Kalpana Viswanath, Jagori (India)
It is good to see ideas of creativity coming into discourses about cities. Cities are deeply creative spaces and this needs to be both understood and fostered. It is also positive that heritage is not only seen as buildings but also the organisation of space, people and traditions.

Issue Paper 5: Urban Rules and Legislation

    A. Issues missing from the paper which need to be added, particularly related to women

Catherine Holt, Huairou Commission
The paper uses the assumption that housing is a human right although I think that is not universally accepted. There are parts of the world that would not agree with this.
The paper does not address the issue of women's rights to land ownership and inheritance or ability to enter into legal agreements.
Although ethics in civil services is mentioned, there is no specific reference to combating the practice of taking advantage of women in order for them to access urban services. Such inappropriate behavior should be easily reportable, investigated seriously and disciplined swiftly.
Engagement does not specifically deal with involving women, especially grassroots women who have different needs and perspectives in community needs. Their points of view are invaluable to policy considerations and should be integrated into the process.
In that the paper does not identify women specifically, it assumes they receive equal access to laws and policies and equal protections in such. This is not the case in many parts of the world and needs to be specifically addressed.
In general, this paper does not address the issue of local rule deciding a particular policy that is then reversed or superseded by state or national law that removes the right of local control from urban dwellers.

Violet Shivutse, Shibuye Community Health Workers (Kenya)
In the section of the Key facts and figures the 3rd section speaks about Good quality law has the power to promote vulnerable groups no mention of women. It would be important to add grassroots Women.

    B. Major points (good and bad) that relate to women

Catherine Holt, Huairou Commission

None of the points in this paper relate specifically to women. On occasion, there is mention of "vulnerable populations," of which women should be included.

Violet Shivutse, Shibuye Community Health Workers (Kenya)
The section on key drivers which says, "For intermediate towns and cities, priority must be placed on the main urban design elements that can reasonably be achieved and that will have the maximum impact on social outcomes and livelihoods. Rights and the protection of vulnerable groups must be central to assessments of impact." This is good if the word 'women' is included.

C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Catherine Holt, Huairou Commission
The paper acknowledges:
The duality of policy with regards to different and vulnerable groups.
The informal rules that often are applied inequitably.
Monitoring and evaluation of rules and laws essential especially with regards to vulnerable populations
The need for institutional and legal frameworks that facilitate and enable the broad based participation of all people and their community organizations.
Urban legal frameworks need to reflect local practices, needs and capacity
Urban planning is under-resourced- needs to be addressed, possibly with private/public partnerships.
Governments need to identify the minimum set of instruments and tools needed to deliver important elements of legal and institutional urban development.

Violet Shivutse, Shibuye Community Health Workers (Kenya)
Strategies of implementation. The section promotes accountability hence it is good for to ensure effective, inclusive implementation.

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Catherine Holt, Huairou Commission
This paper is relevant in that it addressed the needs of poor and vulnerable populations in the urban design, legal and policy participation and protections, and resource allocation. However, women are never mentioned in this paper.

Violet Shivutse, Shibuye Community Health Workers (Kenya)
The issue paper on Urban rules and legislation is very important for grassroots Women. Often the urban rules and legislation determine how grassroots Women access space, safety and participate in development of the urban. Grassroots Women are better placed in influencing what legislation work. This is a section that really needs attention from the grassroots and communities.

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Catherine Holt, Huairou Commission

This paper needs to be reworked so that it specifically addresses challenges and concerns of women in the design of urban environments. Women are not guaranteed the same rights of legally and politically in many areas of the world. Their participation in designing the urban agenda is severely hampered without these basic human rights. Issues such as safety, land tenure and protection from coercion or abuse to receive services must be addressed. Rarely is a man asked for sexual favors to exercise his rights, but women face this consistently. Specific remedies for such actions must be addressed.

Violet Shivutse, Shibuye Community Health Workers (Kenya)
Urban rules and legislation is an important part in the New Urban Agenda. There should be indicators that show how the lives of both men and women will improve based on the New Urban Agenda. The New urban Agenda speaks about equality hence rules and legislation matter so much in enhancing equality. There is need for the paper to really ensure inclusivity of both men and women.

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Catherine Holt, Huairou Commission
This paper brings to the forefront the need to apply the UN's interpretation of "rule of law" and its application to all people. However, it does not address how this could be implemented in areas that do not share that view. Another weakness is that omission of discussion about how to educate the vulnerable and poor populations to their rights and accessing the policy/political system. Advocating effectively for themselves in these areas is a learned behavior and must be taught.

Violet Shivutse, Shibuye Community Health Workers (Kenya)
The weakness of this paper is that it is too general. It keeps talking about the local people as vulnerable which may deny the local people to be looked upon as change agents.

G. General suggestions and commentary

Violet Shivutse, Shibuye Community Health Workers (Kenya)
The section on the key drivers is good as it recognises improvement of livelihoods as key and relates it so well on this being made possible by the laws and implementation.

Issue Paper 6: Urban Governance

A. Issues missing from the paper which need to be added, particularly related to women

Pamela Ransom, Metropolitan College
Places where gender is absent:
In section discussing responsible leadership --(page 5 paragraph 3)
Page 5 bullet 5—change urban governance to "good urban governance" and add language referencing "including women's safety" to the reference to security
Paper needs more language about the role, presence and training of women in public administration and continued attention to monitoring of representation
Page 9 bullet 3: Enhanced policies to support broader partnerships in local governance, including coproduction of service and public goods, involve the private sector and local communities, integrate the informal sector in the urban fabric and collectively bridge institutional and resource gaps.—COULD INCLUDE SPECIFIC REFERENCE INCLUDING NETWORKS OF WOMEN AND OTHER MARGINALIZED GROUPS
No strong references to increased use of monitoring and indicators of gender analysis across institutions or attention to lessons learned from analysis of gender dynamics in municipal governance institutions
Stronger language about needing to continue to increase the participation of women in policy arenas as well as the labour market, by expanding child-care facilities and parental support
Add more language along the lines of ensuring that women should play an active role as an organized interest group in formulation, design and resource allocation in various stages of programs and projects--and that all of these stages need creative government partnerships to ensure that women influence these phases through their collective voice
Add more language about ongoing attention in government policy towards special initiatives which reduce inequities in access and safety for women in areas such as access for women and caregivers in public transport
Strengthen language re Beal "Decision-makers in local government, public office and planning bodies need to be encouraged to provide training for career and skills development along these lines and to institute operational procedures and an organizational culture which fosters gender-sensitive practice and inclusive partnerships"
Add more language about urban policy needs to reflect broader issues government policy "--some countries and institutions have instituted shorter work hours and family-friendly working arrangements such as flexible hours, part-time work, job-sharing, work from home and telecommuting.
General Comments:
What is Missing:
Main Concepts Section
Definition of urban governance: Why is this not consistent with past definitions used by UN Habitat for example on their website?
• "Urban governance is the sum of the many ways individuals and institutions, public and private, plan and manage the common affairs of the city. It is a continuing process through which conflicting or diverse interests may be accommodated and cooperative action can be taken. It includes formal institutions as well as informal

arrangements and the social capital of citizens." (See <u>UN Habitat</u>). If core definitions are changing there should be some way to explain the rationale.
Trend Summary:
Why not continue to push towards the use of the term "good urban governance framework" throughout the paper which is part of previous work of UN Habitat through the Global Campaign on Urban Governance building around the five core themes of governance a) effectiveness, equity, participation, accountability and security (for example—last sentence page 3 rather than saying accountability and transparency are at the core of urban governance). The paper in many places, such as the section on policy on page 6 changes terms to different wording like "sound urban governance"—it would be useful to have a CORE theme and set of objectives such as that articulated in the good urban governance index and principles that is echoed throughout Habitat with clear types of criteria to help provide more direction towards change at the municipal level.
Referral to the issues of the threats of tax evasion and the informal economy (last paragraph page 3): It should be noted that women are often supported through the informal sector and a balanced discussion of things like incentives for informal business and incentives for informal business such as informal public markets, street vending etc. should be reflected in the language.. --this is in some other parts of the paper but a balanced discussion about the pros and cons of the informal sector should be reflected throughout
Recheck language consistency in discussion of concepts such as " Effective urban governance" requirements between document produced by Habitat: Again there is some inconsistency with other definitions of what this is with documents Habitat is producing—In the principles of good urban governance the requirements including predictability of transfers, published performance delivery standards, consumer satisfaction surveys, existence of a vision statement. This paper indicates that effective urban governance "requires a more sophisticated relationship with clearly assigned responsibilities, a stronger collaboration between different level s of government (multilevel governance), and regular and more creative means of interaction with civil society."
Add more about growing trends with single adult households and women-maintained families emerging as an important and growing household form. Single adult households are invariably headed by women. A growing phenomenon is an increase in the number of women-maintained families. Also check adding more about trends related to aging populations—note the trends towards more women in urban areas particularly at older ages as well as national differences ex. China It is only at older ages that the sex ratio in urban areas exceeds the sex ratio in rural areas; Russia more women in urban areas
Also note that urbanization is having impacts on declines in traditional family support still exists to a greater or lesser degree in most countries, it is becoming less available with urbanization and the increased labor force participation (Trends World Women, 2010).

Quazi Baby, Participatory Development Action Program-PDAP (Bangladesh)
I did not see any women issue has mentioned in the paper. The access to basic services for the urban poor women must be acknowledged by government agencies. It still receives little attention, with thousands of slum dwellers living in everyday fear of eviction, will no hope of rehabilitation that is targeted to their wellbeing and livelihoods.

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
The women need to be heard in their demands through a network at the national level advocating the state and local authorities. For that is important to include the trained women in local and state programmes of land and housing access rights issues related to advocate processes of land sanitation for example to get the land tenure or to approve a law proposal against evictions. The legislation process training empowers the women and change the communities situation through the implementation of tools and strategies with the state and local authorities. It also allows the women to get the leadership and cut the barriers the women had with the men presence for many years the men had as leaders without any result.
In summary: The issues missing related to women are:
1. The advocate process in land and housing access rights made by the women at the national level
2. The leadership of the women in the communities and their involvement in local programmes and action plans is a key to get the development required.

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
There is much missing from this paper in general terms, particularly in examining the drivers of change in moving urban governance from being a good idea to being institutionalized. It ignores elite capture of governance processes to promote their own interests.
With regard to women, although there are references to the need for women to be in decision-making positions, it neglects the need in urban governance to move from consultation to negotiation.

Catherine Holt, Huairou Commission
Although this paper does mention grassroots women's as a vulnerable population, it does not address issues specific to their needs, such as; safe cities, their inclusion in human rights, participation in democratic rule - which is denied in some areas of the world, public health needs specific to women, and developing leadership models that apply more specifically to leadership styles of women.
Once again, there is no reference to combating the abuse of women by government officials are authorities when women attempt to access services. When officials act unethically, corrective measures must be swift.

Jane Anyango, Polycom Development Project (Kenya)
Issue paper 6 is very general, as much as it acknowledges that The New Urban Agenda won't work unless all relevant stakeholders are engaged, they are not specific on who these relevant stakeholders are. In such cases women are lumped under other titles yet women issues are very distinct and should be handled specifically. Women are only mentioned a few times.

   B. Major points (good and bad) that relate to women

Pamela Ransom, Metropolitan College
Places in the paper where gender is mentioned:

Policy section--paragraph 1 page 5: capacity building programs need to support gender responsive planning and budgeting"
Processing and dissemination of data disaggregated by age and sex needs a revolution to be readily available to support territorial (disaggregation) to be able to support local planning and monitoring of urban development
Page 4: Issue Summary page 4: "Decentralisation works best when it encounters a lively civil society (that is, organised interests with some autonomy from the state). If social groups are aware, assertive and well organised for political purposes, they are likely to keep elected representatives well informed of their problems and hard pressed for responses and for effective,honest governance.In this context, gender-sensitive best practice would be for local government to keep open the channels of communication and foster mechanisms for dialogue with groups and organisations representing women. However, the onus is also on organisations of civil society to facilitate women's participation and the articulation and representation of gender interest
• Question whether this last sentence should be worded in this way—does this mitigate needs for government support for facilitating women's participation—in addition this is a word for word citation without attribution to J Beall 1996
• see http://www.ucl.ac.uk/dpu-projects/drivers_urb_change/urb_society/pdf_gender/UNDP_Beall_gender_matters.pdf
Page 7 bullet 2: There is an increased need for partnership and collaboration with communities, the private sector, civil society and women's organizations as with central and other levels of government
• Consider greater integration of Beals language: To achieve these, it is important to foster horizontal linkages between different organisations and actors involved in human settlements development: politicians, activists, advocacy groups, self-help organisations, professionals, employers, users and beneficiaries. It is also necessary to maintain vertical linkages between the various levels of political power - local, regional, national and federal - and ensure that the interests of both women and men are represented at each stage.
Page 7 bullet 5: "Globally, women are grossly underrepresented in mayoral positions and local governance institutions. In every region, the number is under 15% of the total number of mayors. While data is largely lacking, the evidence that does exist tells us that when women are represented in decision-making positions, the priorities of families, women, and ethnic and racial minorities are scaled-up. "
• Comment: could add encouragement for governments to do a better job of tracking and recording data such as women councilors as percentage of the total number in local authorities"
Page 9 bullet 6: Key Drivers for Action section--"Women's leadership and gender responsive local governance mindful of the specific needs of women and men and fostering equal participation in local decision making and policymaking for more inclusive, balanced and dynamic governance."
Page 9 bullet 7: Key Drivers for Action section: "Participatory city decision-making and active citizenship via platforms engaging youth, women, minorities, communities and all citizens, continuous and structured dialogue, meaningful consultations , and others forms of constructive commitments between local institutions and non-state actors to guarantee long-term empowerment inclusion of all in the city decision-making process."
• Add language about "increased government support for these structures"

Quazi Baby, Participatory Development Action Program-PDAP (Bangladesh)
The major points are:
1. Community resilience through Leadership development of grassroots women
2. Women are able to protect their community from Disaster or climate change
3. Grassroots leaders are able to contact direct with government official, policy makers and parliament members.

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
The good points:
- To make decisions at the local level through local programmes like the participatory budget that benefits the communities
- To occupy the leadership in the communities and be respected b the men
- To get the local and state supporting to change the situation of poverty.
- To develop a process of land sanitation to get a resilient community.
- The empowered women are able to occupy political charges at the local and national level.
Bad points:
- The women need to cut the male barriers they have in most of the communities
- The women need to form strong organizations to be heard in their demands.
- The lack of training is a problem the women need to change to get respected in their rights."

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
The major points are: a) the need for women to work with other stakeholders in a more efficient way (goodish, but vague); b) increased need for partnership between women's organisations (amongst others) and local government (goodish but vague); c) women are under-represented in mayoral positions (good); d) that women in decision-making positions promote family and the role of women and are the role of ethnic and racial minorities (cited although paper admits there is little evidence - therefore not necessarily helpful); e) need for gender responsive local governance (good); f) need for gender disaggregated data (good). Taken individually none of the points are negative, but are not presented in a compelling way. Taken as a whole they do not represent a powerful and integrated package with regards to women's empowerment through good governance.

Catherine Holt, Huairou Commission
It does include women's leadership as a key driver of action. However, it also lumps men and women together when assessing informal employment. I think they should be analyzed separately, as that will show a very different picture.
Grassroots participation and bottom up approaches in governance and policy-making is recognized as important to urban development.
Women have more experience in peer-to-peer exchanges which is mentioned as a modality to increase collaboration between urban areas.

Jane Anyango, Polycom Development Project (Kenya)
In issue summary, the last point states that: Globally, women are grossly underrepresented in mayoral positions and local governance institutions. When women are represented in decision-making positions, the priorities of families, ethnic and racial minorities and the poorest are scaled-up.

C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Quazi Baby, Participatory Development Action Program-PDAP (Bangladesh)
The main issues for the women are insufficient toilets, insecurity and lack of health care.
Most slum dwellers have no option but to dispose in drains, open fields and river banks. The use of hanging latrines, suspended over ponds and rivers is twice as high in urban slums. This means that urban water sources are more likely to be contaminated with raw sewage. Community latrines in slums are often dirty, badly maintained and lack privacy. Residents often have to wait in line to access them and this sometimes leads to heated exchanges. Communal latrines also pose a security risk to women should they need to use them at night.

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
- Local and regional government work close to their communities on a daily basis
- Globally women are grossly under-represented in mayoral position and local governance institutions when women are represented in decision making position. The priorities of families' ethnic and racial minorities and the poorest scaled up.
- The women networks participation in local action plans
- Local governments need to strengthen their capacities to mobilise local resources

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
The emphasis in the paper on transparency and accountability potentially provides a powerful leverage point for grassroots women if one takes into account the Huairou Commission's strategies for empowerment of women to hold authorities to account i.e. data gathering, mapping, training in governance skills including budget interrogation and interpretation etc.

Catherine Holt, Huairou Commission
Decentralization would allow more participation of women if handled inclusively. Women are also mentioned as a group that needs to be included in participatory decision-making and that, as a group they are largely under-represented in government.
The paper also acknowledges that when women are involved in decision-making process, priorities of families and women, as well as, ethical government and inclusion of racial minorities is scaled up.
Bottom-up approach and participation of grassroots communities in city management and policy-making is acknowledged.

Jane Anyango, Polycom Development Project (Kenya)
The paper should mention women or rather specific stakeholders; this will bring out a clear picture on the important role of women.

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Pamela Ransom, Metropolitan College

Places where marginalized or grassroots is mentioned:
Page 7 bullet 4: A bottom--up approach and the participation of grassroots communities in city management and policymaking are important as they work and live in the locality and thus are well placed to contribute to local projects
• Addition language re grassroots that could be considered: "encouraging local authorities to take into consider greater recognition of grassroots (including grassroots women's networks) organizing strategies"
Page 9 last paragraph: The New Urban Agenda won't work unless "all relevant stakeholders, under a strong leadership of the local government, will join their forces and establish permanent structures of dialogue to make sure cities are places of opportunity for all"
• Add language on "all relevant stakeholders including grassroots and marginalized groups"

Quazi Baby, Participatory Development Action Program-PDAP (Bangladesh)
Urban law should place more emphasis on institutional processes and be more reflective of the fact that public administration is the channel through which municipal and local governments interpret and pursue the objectives of sustainable development
The Urban law should be women friendly. Especially in case of sexual abuse or violence against women, law should be supported in fever of women.

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
The relevance to grassroots women:
1. Urban governance is conditioned by the improvement of local leadership, human resources, and technical and management capacities of Local and Regional government
2. Continuous and structure dialogue, local institutions and non-state actors have demonstrated their impact.
3. Sound urban governance is gender issues and requires the inclusion and participation of youth and minorities."

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
The paper does not differentiate grassroots women from women in general. It neglects to the need to explore how grassroots women's perceptions of priorities vary from other women.

Catherine Holt, Huairou Commission
This paper recognizes the need to include grassroots women in the decision-making process and governance. It recognizes their unique perspective and the value of their input.

Jane Anyango, Polycom Development Project (Kenya)
The paper is very relevant, but should be specific; the roadmap is clear but should be more specific on women. It is well inclusive.

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Quazi Baby, Participatory Development Action Program-PDAP (Bangladesh)

It is mention in the paper that the New Urban Agenda will need to be implemented in towns, cities and metropolitan areas, that is, at the local level. So, the term "Localization" takes into account territorial contexts, governments and local stakeholders, from the definition of the New Urban Agenda priorities, to its implementation by involving grassroots women leaders.

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
- Improving the local leadership, local resources, technical and management capacities of local and regional governments to beneficiaries
- Including all relevant stakeholders to get a new transformative urban agenda, with special reference to the essential role of private sector communities with gender equity.
- Using the data and make it readily available to support urban planning and be possible the monitoring of urban development.
- Improving universal access to basic services and reducing poverty and exclusion in collaboration with civil society, particularly in marginalized neighborhoods and slums in developing countries

Catherine Holt, Huairou Commission
This paper does explain the need for decentralized, transparent, ethical, equitable, local government that is functional and transparent. It needs to further define how to get vulnerable populations educated as to how to be involved in governance and government processes.
The paper also acknowledges the need for urban development to be eco-friendly and sustainable.

Jane Anyango, Polycom Development Project (Kenya)
The issue summary is very clear and practical as much as there is very low mention of women. Inclusion and clear mention of women will give the women and specifically grassroots women a weapon to claim their space in representation and participation. The word women should be included and mentioned any time stakeholders are being mentioned.

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Pamela Ransom, Metropolitan College
The paper could do a better job of creating and emphasizing some key priorities-- moving towards identifying more SMART objectives in a way that pulls out some central directions for a period in the future that are easy to follow.
Add more language of examples of innovative partnerships of women related to governance--e.g. local to local dialogues and the need to enhance training and capacity building around these strategies.
Editorial Flaws:
Phrasing of last sentence page 5/first sentence page 6 "puts severely their reliance and those of …at risk"
Page 6 bullet 2: ers, etc.).

"Local governments should contribute to integrate the informal sector in the urban fabric through regulation, oversee and targeted support, including the coproduction of public services"

Quazi Baby, Participatory Development Action Program-PDAP (Bangladesh)
The paper has been written in general way. But there are a lot of problems, which have to face by the women. If the problems are not mentioned in the paper, then how we will solve the problems?
This paper is good to discuss on urban issues, but laws are very hard to understand, especially for the poor people and will be difficult to implementation.

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
Strengths of this paper
- The information related to the important increasing in global declaration as Rio+20, Habitat II and recent negotiations in post 2015 obtained as result of an effective governance
- The citizens need rapid and flexible responses to face urban challenges and solve daily needs, institutions, private sector and civil society need to find new understanding and work together in a more efficient way.
- The metropolitan dimension is becoming increasingly relevant. Cities are more interdependent with their surrounding settlements, but they are trapped into old administrative structures and legislative frameworks.
- The new transformative urban agenda needs to include all relevant stakeholders, with special reference to the essential role of private sector.
Weaknesses:
- Unfortunately in many cities, large sections of the urban population that cannot access the formal political system. Cities have become places of raising inequality, and these situations often degenerate into conflict, especially in fragile contexts.
- Governing without the citizen has become nearly impossible. No effective governance can take place without a strong and capable leadership from the public sector. In many parts of the world, the informal provision of basic services and the tax evasion produced by the informal economy keep being one of the major threats to good governance. Corruption at local level constitutes the other big scourge of the urbanising world.

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
The general weakness of the paper is that it is over-generalised and uncritical of its own positions. It does not examine different governance traditions in different regions nor does it give any examples of success or lessons learned. It does not identify key entry points to promote good governance. It only has one mention of corruption, which is almost universally used by power elites to undermine good urban governance. It says nothing about anti-corruption efforts. It fails to examine how the ideology of the market, which is arguably a more powerful driver of change in the public sector, intersects (for both good and bad) with urban governance. It is insufficiently critical of decentralisation, which has in a number of countries has rolled back years of hard-won gains in good governance.
The paper's strength is that a comprehensive and integrated vision of one version of good governance that can provide guidance for the Habitat III process.

Catherine Holt, Huairou Commission
This paper addresses the need for responsive and ethical urban governance and ways to promote such practices. Decentralization is emphasized. It makes many good points about inclusion of all in governance and subsidiarity.
The paper is written in academic language which is not conducive to an understanding when read by marginalized populations. The first sentence likens governance to software and governments as hardware. I would posit that a majority of the population has no idea what that means given they do not access computers.
Public services are assumed to be a basic human right. This is not true everywhere in the world. There is no mention of how to encourage or pressure governments to accept this concept.
This issue of taxes is mentioned as a revenue source, however any tax system that is implemented to include informal work and income must not unfairly burden those populations.
I think that a major void in this paper is not addressing the need and expense of educating the populace to good governance principles and how to access basic services, etc.

Jane Anyango, Polycom Development Project (Kenya)
The paper is very orderly, the structures are very clear. Key drivers for action have no mention for woman at all.
The document brings out the point on inequality which has seen women left out in the line of development.

G. General suggestions and commentary

Pamela Ransom, Metropolitan College
Key Drivers for Action: Other missing elements:
improved metropolitan and megacity governance (page 9) bullet 1: More language encouraging support for increased training and education of government officials, coordination and dissemination of standards of good governance, encouragement and support for creative strategies for citizen monitoring, including monitoring by women's networks and monitoring and dissemination of results of good governance indicators
Last bullet page 9: City-to-city cooperation as a collaborative and peer-to peer exchange Modality between cities, administrative staff and elected leaders
For capacity development, based on north south and
South south cooperation and the support of local governments associations
• Could add language here about between cities, administrative staff, elected leaders and "civil society and women's and grassroots women's groups"
Strengthen intermediary city governance, foster regional development and urban-rural linkages –innovative governance arrangements and target policies to strengthen the role of middles size cities as regional hubs, develop integrated regional strategies and plans, improve complementarities between cities and towns at subnational level through coordination and collaborative mechanisms between local and regional governments
• Could add more language about "between local and regional governments and civil society groups" in the last part of the sentence

Stronger language that data related to women in urban areas needs further attention to global challenges on gender related data--Gender issues cannot be adequately reflected if existing sex-disaggregated statistics are classified into categories that are too broad or are not further disaggregated by relevant characteristics, such as age, residence or educational level. Finally, the quality of data varies across countries. One or more of the above-mentioned shortcomings are often encountered in data related to international migration, maternal mortality, causes of death, vocational education, access to and use of information and communication technologies, the informal sector and informal employment. The same is true of data on occupations, wages, unemployment and underemployment, decision makers in government and the private sector, and household poverty.

Quazi Baby, Participatory Development Action Program-PDAP (Bangladesh)
Most poor people do not live under the shelter of the law and the opportunities it affords. Because the poor lack recognized rights, they are vulnerable to abuse. So, the poor people need to understand the law and it should be circulated in local language and aware people through electronic/print media and education centre as well as civil society.

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
General suggestions: The information related to Urban governance is a relevant one and important to take into account in the work of the women as actors of the development in the communities. The inclusion of the women as important part of the civil society must be mentioned in all levels. The women are key in the development in programmes at the state and local level. Women must take decisions, occupy political charges and be part of the action and local plans of the government.

Paul Taylor, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
The paper is conventional, pedestrian and stale and could have been written fifteen years ago. In other words it does not address the "New" aspect of the urban agenda. It lacks evidence that good governance works in improving service delivery, and ignores the issues of high cost and delays that are cited by critics of governance approaches. If it wanted exciting new evidence it could do worse than draw on the findings of the Huairou Commission anti-corruption work which gives practical examples of how a focus on achieving concrete ends in terms of improved public services involves using good governance tools.

Catherine Holt, Huairou Commission
This paper addresses many areas of governance at the urban level. It is generally well-written. I think that the ideas expressed in this document need to be translated into layman's terms to be more widely distributed to populations that should be giving input.

Jane Anyango, Polycom Development Project (Kenya)
I am proud as an urban grassroots woman to be included in this process. Our unity is our strength.

Veronica Katulushi, Zambia Homeless and Poor People's Federation

Favours the rich and men mostly: As a woman it is very difficult to access land as compared to men. The land market is not user friendly especially to the poor or the vulnerable in society.

Issue Paper 7: Municipal Finance

   A. Issues missing from the paper which need to be added, particularly related to women

Magdalena García Hernández, MIRA (Mexico)
In the case of keywords you need to add: gender budgeting, progressive taxes, redistributive fiscal policies and participatory budgeting.
Absent is the issue of social participation.

   B. Major points (good and bad) that relate to women

Magdalena García Hernández, MIRA (Mexico)
It is necessary to develop good urban policies.
The shortcomings of governance systems affecting government operations and classified into three:
1. Inconsistency of urban institutions: those that can be addressed with the instrument Statute of Cities, which gives order and coherence in territorial planning. A policy instrument of this nature should regulate the real estate sector manner, to achieve the comprehensive development of neighborhoods that cover the different needs of women and men in their different age conditions holistically. Additionally institutional coordination alone is not enough to achieve an structures geographically coherent, it also requires inter-sectoral coordination (public, private and social sectors) involved women, which favors the vertical and horizontal coordination.
2. Inadequate structures for integrated urban planning and intergovernmental fiscal relations: they must be neutralized by virtuous incentives associated with those related to the reduction of carbon footprint, but also with incentives linked to the improvement of urban sustainability indicators gender perspective to be built. In addition, government subsidies in public services are increasingly necessary in areas where their wage policy does not conform to the compensation recommended by the ILO, the regressive distribution of the value generated in the production process, with huge concentration tendencies in short hands, dislocated the subsidy schemes that could be reduced with affective income redistribution policies, which include closing the income gap between women and men.
3. Insufficient support for building an effective and economically viable urban development process: what processes can be improved with strengthening citizenship to guide government action continuously, before natural discontinuity periods governance.
At the governmental level, manuals and simple protocols and certification processes permanent government staff, project management with a gender perspective, defined and constructed in these areas of inter-sectoral coordination are required. Mechanisms and instruments to neutralize the labor mobility of government staff. The type of World Bank projects must be reviewed and validated so that they are relevant to the realities that apply. Mechanisms and instruments to neutralize also the labor mobility of government staff.

   C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Magdalena García Hernández, MIRA (Mexico)
The need to improve public finances through financing, training and local technical assistance to provide better services.
The need for improved urban governance.
The recognition of the existence of corruption.
Points relevant to women's issues:
- Municipal budgets from a gender perspective
- Participatory budgeting
- The existence of local development agencies planning the territory, with equal participation of women and grassroots women
- Women's organizations basic moral guarantees as collateral for loans urban projects financed by credit institutions, which are involved in the design, monitoring and evaluation monitoring

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Magdalena García Hernández, MIRA (Mexico)
It is highly relevant to grassroots women, since they are the main managers of public services in their communities.

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Magdalena García Hernández, MIRA (Mexico)
It's the topic that includes the fact that the main purpose of the municipal finance is providing the welfare of the community that are composed of women and men with a condition, position, needs and different interests to be taken into account to achieve welfare of both.

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Magdalena García Hernández, MIRA (Mexico)
It refers to important issues:
- Weak decentralization
- Poor governance systems
- Weak tax collection
- The underdevelopment of the municipalities to access the capital markets
- The visibility of corruption

Not develop anything about:
Women and equality between women and men
- Inter-sectoral coordination involving civil society
- Redistributive policies
- The negative impact of the internationalization of the government with the negative effects produce for the "reforms" with the privatization process of public services

G. General suggestions and commentary

Magdalena García Hernández, MIRA (Mexico)
It is necessary to strengthen the principle of federalism linked to the
strengthening of local governance that will lead to the existence of
mechanisms for consultation, observation and social control.
Conduct participatory budgets with a gender perspective, as already happens
in many Latin American countries (Argentina, Brazil, Uruguay) it is further
measures necessary.
Reducing inequality of income redistributive policies promoted by the three
levels of government, will be a measure that results in an increase in
government revenue and increased resources for local governments. Exercise of
transparency in spending reinforces progress in the tax culture of the
population.
The most effective delivery of public services requires the strengthening of
municipal governance, to achieve synergies in the provision of relevant and
appropriate services to the population accessing their rights, especially
grassroots women who are managers quintessential thereof.
The international financial market financing of local governments may be less
risky if there are further local development agencies involving civil society
in which women, to monitor the type of projects and the exercise of spending
involved.
Endogenous financial resources for the development of secure, productive and
livable for women and men, cities come, largely as a result of productive
development policies, wage policies attached to the guidelines of the ILO
decent wages. Seeking to increase public resources in conditions of extreme
inequality and widespread poverty, the tax burden will fall in captive cause,
without improving the quality of life of the population.
A better structuring of transfers and mandates for local income generation to
promote efficiency in service delivery and resource management for operations
and capital investment requires consultation with women and men from the town
who contribute to the determination of their immediate and mediate needs in
your community.
It is essential that governance schemes listed, women have a leading role,
according to the ongoing activity in this area developed by grassroots women.
The type of World Bank projects must be reviewed and validated so that they
are relevant to the different realities that apply.
The agenda of consistent reforms in privatization of public services has not
given the expected results, has become more expensive services and their
quality deteriorated, with the difference that the resources do not enter the
public purse. The informal growth of cities caused by job insecurity and slow
economic growth limited the increase in property tax revenues, again,
redistributive income policies, reactivate the domestic market and employment
and thus the production process and collection corresponding tax.

It would be important that the self-assessment tool of municipal finance from the World Bank include the gender perspective, and social participation, including women in their application.

The prioritization of expenditures must respond to social cost and benefit not only to criteria of profitability, in what appears to be a business approach, which is not relevant in public administration.

An important instrument to assess the balance in the distribution of municipal spending is provided by the Urban Prosperity Index of UN Habitat, which must incorporate the gender perspective.

The regulation of environmental activities, green buildings, eliminating emissions, etc., can be a source of fiscal incentives or charges for penalties that would favor the municipal public finances in the short, medium and long term.

Transportation projects should be considered in studies of the routes, the corresponding women and men of different form, because in this case an average not reflect the route either. Good design of routes, means, also, a good economic recovery in spending, which will contribute to the increase of municipal finances.

To maximize the potential of endogenous resources and strengthening and improving financial capacities of municipalities, it requires no impoverished population, so many redistributive policies must happen: fiscal, productive labor, will be the best way to dispose of allowing local resources to be supplemented by loans with lower leverage.

Rigorous evaluation of the ability to service the debt of government authorities must have an inter-sectoral mechanism with equal participation of women, to monitor and avoid excessive debt has led to losses of entire countries.

Commitments decentralization can strengthen them by strengthening mechanisms for inter-sectoral involvement in women's participation.

It is proposed that the financial sector recognizes the social guarantees given by women's groups to follow up on the implementation of the projects.

On the issue of credit rating agencies of municipal government levels, they must disclose their rating criteria, so that their actions do not exhaust the existing social comptrollers.

The reforms of urban governance must incorporate the equal participation of women, with a prominent position of women grassroots main management of urban services.

The expansion of endogenous resources requires income and heritage redistribution policies that reduce the social and economic inequalities of gender and ethnicity in the territories.

Strengthen financial and asset management through private participation mechanisms for inter-sectoral and social issues, with equal participation of women.

Improving systems of urban infrastructure financing using non-onerous resources from development banks.

Include collateral from the involvement of grassroots women in the design,
monitoring and progress of projects funded credit resources.
The support of the international community to build a global network of the
city with equality between women and men to become of better generalized
practice in the world.

Issue Paper 8: Urban and Spatial Planning and Design

A. Issues missing from the paper which need to be added, particularly related to women

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
The inclusion of the women in the process of spatial design of the communities
One of the actors present in the spatial design and planning is the role played by the women

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
The paper has a quite comprehensive understanding of planning and emphasizes the need to strengthen the capacity of local governments to take on this responsibility. It has a lot of good points in terms of physical planning, the need for social integration, and the right to the city. But it avoids the political and gendered nature of planning. There is no emphasis on tenure security for women or their safety from violence. When discussing issues, gender issues need to be included.
There are only two references to participation of women -- p. 6 "improved planning outcomes by addressing the distinct needs of various groups such as women, youth and indigenous communities" and p.7 "Engage diverse segments of the population, particularly the poor, women, youth and marginalized groups, in urban and territorial planning". That is good but there are no measures/recommendations on how to engage or ensure meaningful participation of grassroots women.

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
While the paper is subjected to urban and spatial planning, it mentions at one point that women, if engaged in urban and territorial planning, would be effective. This issue could have been elaborated to some extent of design and execution of participatory planning.

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)
The research shows evidence that the social role which functions within the public space, has implications for the way it is perceived and used by women: Páramo, P., & Burbano, A.M. (2011)
• Resource from which you can get benefit or economic advantage.
• Space for connectivity by which to reach a destination.
• Recreational, sporting, cultural and entertainment areas.
Also they are missing issues related to women as in the European Charter for Women in the city. (1996):
• Security and special services of intervention in critical situations, such as women's shelters.
• Mobility and exclusive transport.
• Equipment of proximity.
• Nomenclature for security "know where you are and where you are going."
• Infrastructure and emergency lights. "For help, see and be seen"
• Symbolic nomenclature for women (stations, theaters, streets, neighborhoods and other municipalities, etc.).
• New technologies and mobility.

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
Good points:
The spatial design and planning that includes the women point of view
The women participation in the process of rapid urbanization of the cities
- Urban extensions and transformation need to be guided by well-designed plans.
- Strategies and policies which did not address compactness, connectivity and integration of cities have produced unsustainable urban patterns and dysfunctional systems of cities.
- Successful urban planning experiences integrate design with legal and finance instruments and can capture and share the value created by spatial decisions.
- Integration of plans across sectors and the multi-scale continuum of planning are crucial to achieve territorial prosperity, resilience and cohesion while mitigating the use of land, energy and natural resources.
- Local and context-driven planning models, based on socio-environmental values and integrated territorial approaches are a pre-condition for a better quality of life and to respect cultural heritage, identity and diversity.9
Strategic planning has been widely adopted and has introduced important innovations but it has not put enough emphasis on spatial aspects which has resulted in a dichotomy between spatial and economic/political decisions
- Incorporating green infrastructure and eco-system based urban and territorial responses into the early stages of planning has resulted in more climate adaptive and resilient environments and services

Bad points: Many countries have initiated a review and revision of their planning legislation and regulation, although obsolete and inadequate planning legislation is still in place in many contexts.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
Overall, the recommendations seem fine but they seem to assume that a lot of these would automatically benefit women, and all stakeholders have the same power and resources! There are two references to the need for participation and considering the needs of women. No reference to specific needs of women and especially grassroots women in discussion of issues or recommendations.
There is no reference to how urban renewal and redevelopment projects often displace poor communities and how this has devastating impacts on grassroots women.

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
The process of Urban Planning itself would be a major issue to be related to women. Also, participatory planning, which quite effectively represents spatial planning is, according to me, the other major point that should be related to women for further consideration.

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)

- Facilitate land tenancy and property rights, which seek some form of economic empowerment.
- Inclusive, sectioned and equitable participation in land planning.

C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
- Good planning provides a level playing field for stakeholders and strengthens transparency and accountability. It has contributed to the prevention of informal and speculative urban developments that endanger the natural environment and displace low-income and vulnerable groups.
- Public participation has contributed to improved planning outcomes by addressing the distinct needs of various groups. Worldwide, the use of participation has grown incrementally for the past two decades.
- Cities, particularly in the developing world, generally lack the capacity to deal and negotiate with the private sector, which has resulted in fragmented development and segregated territories.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
A lot -- access to services and infrastructure, secure tenure, mixed land uses and connectivity, resilience and disaster risk reduction, right to the city, participation, etc. But these need to highlight gender needs and concerns - there is reference to women and the poor only in relation to participation.

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
When it comes to spatial planning on a urban scale, there are several issues that are raised, starting from planning at initial stage to implementation, including policy inputs and social integration. In all these points, women, would not only play an important role but also be benefited in the process.

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)
- Creating living, mixed and socially integrated cities, with sufficient public space and mixed-use areas and which calls for the elimination of the mono-functional spaces. City projects and green terraces.
- The safety that combats the feeling of fear and which creates safe public spaces, free from harassment and violence of different forms.
- Project cities and green terraces (ecohuertos) to help the household economy.

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
Relevance of this paper to grassroots women:
- Planning is an inherently public function whose outcomes have been strengthened by broad engagement at formulation and implementation stages

- Partnerships have contributed to the continuity of long-term urban and spatial planning objectives, particularly in times of political change or short-term impediments. Institutionalization of initiatives is also needed.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
It is a very relevant paper for grassroots women. It is about everything that deals with their everyday life.

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
There is no direct relevance, but of course, when it relates to focusing on issues like spatial and participatory planning, in a way, when we target a specific group in an urban context, women are inevitably a part of it.

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)
A very neutral approach for men and women is perceived; we must conceive of public space and the environment from a distinct perspective for men and women of different ages and roles.

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
- Planning is an inherently public function whose outcomes have been strengthened by broad engagement at formulation and implementation stages.
- Good planning provides a level playing field for stakeholders and strengthens transparency and accountability. It has contributed to the prevention of informal and speculative urban developments that endanger the natural environment and displace low-income and vulnerable groups.
- Partnerships have contributed to the continuity of long-term urban and spatial planning objectives, particularly in times of political change or short-term impediments. Institutionalization of initiatives is also needed.
- Public participation has contributed to improved planning outcomes by addressing the distinct needs of various groups. Worldwide, the use of participation has grown incrementally for the past two decades.
- Cities, particularly in the developing world, generally lack the capacity to deal and negotiate with the private sector, which has resulted in fragmented development and segregated territories.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
I can't imagine how the paper can engender the new urban agenda with just two references to "women", and without any mention of the need for gender sensitive policies and strategies.

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
The New Urban Agenda could be served with issues like planning of urban population growth in advance, interpretation of rapid on-going urbanization, promotion of compact cities, provision of adequate public spaces. These sectors, could be separately elaborated to make a detailed proposal for New Urban Agenda.

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)
It serves to break the current mobility scheme in gender charges, approaching the mixed-use institutional services and saving time on travel and security of women.

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
Strengths:
- Urban extensions and transformation need to be guided by well-designed plans.
- Strategies and policies which did not address compactness, connectivity and integration of cities have produced unsustainable urban patterns and dysfunctional systems of cities.
- Successful urban planning experiences integrate design with legal and finance instruments and can capture and share the value created by spatial decisions.
- Incorporating green infrastructure and eco-system based urban and territorial responses into the early stages of planning has resulted in more climate adaptive and resilient environments and services.
Weaknesses:
- Many countries have initiated a review and revision of their planning legislation and regulation, although obsolete and inadequate planning legislation is still in place in many contexts.
- Integration of plans across sectors and the multi-scale continuum of planning are crucial to achieve territorial prosperity, resilience and cohesion while mitigating the use of land, energy and natural resources.
- Local and context-driven planning models, based on socio-environmental values and integrated territorial approaches are a pre-condition for a better quality of life and to respect cultural heritage, identity and diversity.9
- Strategic planning has been widely adopted and has introduced important innovations but it has not put enough emphasis on spatial aspects which has resulted in a dichotomy between spatial and economic/political decisions.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
It is a technically strong and well written paper - comprehensive approach that considers all aspects of planning -- except for the political! No explicit mention of gender, race/ethnicity and class issues.
No mention of how meaningful participation (of grassroots women and poor and indigenous communities) can be achieved.

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
To some extent, this paper speaks in detail about urban planning process with facts and figures, which is very effective. But then, it covers many concepts at once. Perhaps, one issue could have been focused on and detailed out. Such as, Spatial Planning- this could have been an entire paper on Spatial planning which would have covered various sections.

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)
The main weakness is that although the idea of compact cities arose, is the theme of mobility seen in its comprehensiveness.
The main strength is the social activation for social integration that favors the safety of women and girls.

G. General suggestions and commentary

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
- The design and spatial planning must incorporate the women participation. To get the integration and sustainability of the cities.
- The women must know what kind of city want to have for living.
- It is important to include the women in the process of integration of cities to produce sustainable urban patterns and functional systems of cities.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
Add strategies for ensuring meaningful participation of women and poor communities -- providing not only information, but also resourcing them to be able to organize and participate effectively in decisions that affect their lives.
Add building capacity and providing resources for community level planning - to ensure meaningful participation of women and poor communities.
Add training of planners, as well as local and other government officials, on gender sensitivity and how to work with women and poor communities.
Emphasize gender dimension of security of tenure
Add the issue of and measures to prevent displacement of poor communities in urban renewal and redevelopment projects
Furthermore, planning institutions should collaborate with community based and civil society organizations in improving participatory planning practices. Academic institutions should work with local communities.

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
As a whole, this paper serves as an overview of how Urban Spaces could be interpreted and planned. This is good as a general review on concepts of Urbanization and spatial planning.

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)
The issue of transportation and users. Transport linked to sustainable development (media as a scale project) is not currently included in urban development plans; the circulatory system of the city is left as a non-priority topic. It is fashionable in the public agenda for improving the quality of life and economic development.
Chaotic cities, some planned un-competitively and designed around cars; there is a wrong approach to the issue of mobility; the mobility plan linked to a single element that is public transport bus and taxi with all its current deficiencies. Mobility is handled the wrong way; Mobility is everything,

pedestrians, roads signs, the regulatory and administrative, streets and bikeways, traffic lights, and ICT networks.

Pedestrians have lost public space; It has lost a space between urban and human scales because of the car; urbanization occurred rapidly (abandonment of the countryside) and broke the city limits. Large urban centers exist not to live in but so that all of us fit, massive homes and gated communities, far from urban centers. There is not a good mix of land use, only mono-functional spaces.

Low profitability of public transport bus. Mobility is not perceived as a civil and human right.

There are many gaps and normative conflicts in mobility of public transport, you cannot divide taxis and buses with limits (municipalities without power and many political conflicts).

DUIS (integrated sustainable urban development), dependent on the car, away from urban centers and service. Models of dormitory cities where you don't know your neighbors, divisions that do not allow the entry of public transport; the cities are highly dynamic and increasingly complex in the way that problems are addressed; change the way you perceive and plan the city; Current sector programs are letters of good wishes and intentions but are rigid six-year instruments even when current needs and have generated other dynamics of change.

Within PDUs very little is spoken and there is a huge gap in mobility issues. They should formulate a single transport sector program that includes all issues.

Most essential is to understand how to promote spaces for social interaction.

Issue Paper 9: Urban Land

A. Issues missing from the paper which need to be added, particularly related to women

Ann Wanjiru, GROOTS Kenya
- Empowering women based organisation to articulate their own challenges
- Emphasis on dissemination of relevant information on policies affecting them.

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)
• Homelessness, poverty and population without income.
• Women Heads of household.
• Access to water, sanitation and energy.
• Human settlements and housing conditions.
• Multiculturalism, migration and land tenure.
• Perceptions of inequality and conflicts over land tenure.
• Work paid and unpaid.

B. Major points (good and bad) that relate to women

Ann Wanjiru, GROOTS Kenya
- The point on incorporate the priorities, needs, and experiences of citizens and communities, especially for women, the poor, and other vulnerable groups. In turn, development must be owned by the communities themselves.
- The calls for a move towards pluralistic and inclusive policies and frameworks that are equitable and include women, girls and marginalised groups and people living in the rural areas connected to urban centres.

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)
• Facilitate land tenure and legitimate property rights, seeking somehow forms of economic empowerment for the poor. (good)
• The legal tenure in marginal urban populations, although can have a fair distribution among members (masculinized tenure), there are processes of concentration produced through hierarchies and structures of social and political power that cannot compensate for the inequalities and see women as new subjects of territorial and political rights. (poor)

C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Ann Wanjiru, GROOTS Kenya
- Focusing on the use of GLTN tools
- Secure tenure is foundational to improving housing and living conditions for marginalised groups.

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)

- Promote policies that take into account age and gender and which respect, protect and promote the rights of all people, for women with new territorial legal rights.
- On the issue of transparency and accountability.

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Ann Wanjiru, GROOTS Kenya
There are very few mentions of women and their participation, and no mention of grassroots women in particular.

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)
It is essential to recognize and enforce the acquired and inheritance rights of women as new subjects of territorial holders' legal rights.

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Ann Wanjiru, GROOTS Kenya
It is women who play the biggest role in developing communities. Therefore we need to define women as the engine of change in grassroots communities.

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)
To influence the recognition of women as subjects of territorial rights.

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)
It is the issue of women heads of households in extreme poverty and without income.

G. General suggestions and commentary

Ann Wanjiru, GROOTS Kenya
More emphasis should be on strengthening remedial actions originating or initiated by the communities, especially women.
More emphasis should be made on empowering communities especially grassroots women so that they can interact more effectively with government and other development partners.

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)
It is a very relevant issue, with little information, misdiagnosed, and very invisible.

Issue Paper 10: Urban-rural linkages

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
-How women can impact / transform regional plans, particularly in terms of infrastructure?
- Rethink funding from the point of view of local priorities
- New physical development models to reflect the possibilities of rural-urban linkages

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
In the issue paper aspect related in how to support the linkage of urban-rural programmes we can see only things that inform in general what we can do but not inform how and who can do that taking as basis the role played by the grassroots women from local and national level organizations and women from institutions that train the urban and rural women to get safe and resilient cities.
- We must point out the participation not only of the urban and rural women in the whole process of development in the community but also of other actors in urban - rural linkages like the inclusion of: The NGO, The Private Sector, The University and the Civil Society which was important to take as example to spread the experience at the local and national level. This working experience was presented at the Parliament in the Housing Committee.
We must to point out the grassroots women empowerment in legislation issues about the frame of the laws that is a requirement to dialogue and negotiate with state and local authorities to get the results to benefit the vulnerable communities.
There is also important not only to say that we need to develop legislation and governance mechanisms and tools to enhance rural and urban linkage. But is important to point out important experiences already had by grassroots women. The women from urban areas link with women from rural areas and together exchange working experiences to get the land tenure. The women from rural areas empowered started to dialogue with the local authorities and get the approval of the legal sanitation through the local programme of Participatory Budget. Women from rural areas after advocated to the local authorities got the land tenure from state organization COFOPRI Formalization Commission of Informal Property. The grassroots women from the community of Chocos belong to the Yauyos Province at the high Andean of Peru. The experience started in Chocos and spread to the rest of the districts. From 16 districts from Yauyos Province now 13 of them achieved land tenure. The empowered women put in practice the strategies and tools they created to convince the local and state authorities to get the land property of the community. As much as the women are recognised in their role as actors of community development the women can be considered as a key of the urban and rural development. This aspect must be considered in National Urban Policies, Guidelines on Urban and Territorial Planning. The best experiences leaded by the grassroots women in the development of the communities need to be spread at the national and regional level. To get it is important to promote local investment and finance instruments and systems to support urban-rural linkages principally with the inclusion of the women in land sanitation process.

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
- Food production and food security as entry pout to urban development
- Need for infrastructure that supports women farmers' access to urban markets.
- Land tenure: individual or collective?
- The creation of value-added nodes with urban-rural linkages

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
The good points in urban-rural linkages:
- The leadership as community leaders in both cases
- The women inclusion in the whole process of land sanitation and seismic and resistant construction issues to prevent disasters and become resilient cities.
- The implementation of tools and strategies to advocate the state and local authorities to get results in the benefit of the communities they represent as community leaders.
- The empowerment of the urban and rural women in legislation issues allows them to occupy political charges and advocate for land and housing access rights.
Bad points:
- The lack of inclusion of the women in urban and rural linkages programmes at the local and national level.
- The presence of male problems the women from urban and rural areas need to abolish it to get the gender equally in the communities. The male problem is a barrier that affects the development of the communities. The women demonstrated with concrete programmes how it is possible to change the situation of the vulnerable communities in safe and resilient one.

C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
- Focus on the development of the peri-urban area or small cities, to allow for food production, marketing and access to services (value-added nodes)
- Focus on infrastructure that will reinforce urban-rural linkages: transportation; water and waste management systems; sol remediation; climate control.
- Stop/ control migration from rural areas

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
The interdependencies between urban and rural areas, their flows and functions are further asserted through the economic dynamics and social links.
Access to food, ecosystem services, social services, transport, employment and markets.
The specific context and priorities may differ, these flows, interdependencies and synergies are a reality in both developing and developed countries.
Urban and rural development have different, though equally important, sectoral focuses and benefits.

Given global economic transitions to secondary and tertiary sectors, urban areas tend to draw most domestic and international resources (public and private).

This uneven spatial development is the crux of why strong urban-rural linkages are so essential, in evening out access to resources, services and livelihood opportunities, and equally distributing the economic and other benefits long observed in the urbanization process.

Balanced outcomes across space, and across urban and rural areas, are a vital objective of sustainable development that leaves no one behind, and should also include ensuring strong investment in rural areas.

Urban-rural linkages represent transformative potential for universal sustainable human development. Knowledge generation and management shall ensure that there is enhanced understanding on how functions and flows operate. It will also be essential to ensure sufficient documentation and dissemination of inspiring experiences, tools, practices and strategies in urban–rural linkages in collaboration with research institutions, academia, civil society, rural people and their organizations and governments at all levels. Further, there is an urgent need to identify knowledge gaps especially in relation to current challenges such as climate change, disaster resilience, food security and nutrition.

Tools and frameworks shall be oriented to creating effective and inclusive links throughout the territory that support and address the issues such as infrastructure and services, food security and nutrition, energy, migration, capital, goods, employment, information and technology between rural and urban territories of various sizes including metropolitan regions.

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
- The possibility of benefiting from both urban and rural advantages.
- Lessen the need to migrate to cities to benefit from services for themselves and their children.
- The paper emphasizes that urban-rural issues require a multi-partners' discussion (state, local, civil society, grassroots) of solutions.

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
The relevance to grassroots women is not present in this issue paper the information refers to urban and rural linkage aspects in general. The women demonstrated their success with her inclusion and results obtained in the development of rural communities located at the high Andean of Peru.
The non-relevance is: the lack of inclusion of the role the women play in urban and rural areas as part of the civil society.
- The lack of political volunteer from the state to invest in local and national programmes where the grassroots women got in the development process of the communities.
- The lack of dissemination of good practices with the women inclusion due to the lack of financial supporting from the state government

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
-The paper provides a rational for moving away from mega-cities, and look closely as the mixed-use (urban/rural) development of smaller cities, which would primarily benefit women.
- It makes it imperative for grassroots to be part of decision-making process leading to development.

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
This paper serves to engender the New Urban Agenda through inclusive and sustainable development. To ensure complementary and mutually reinforcing development across rural, peri-urban and urban areas, as an integral part of both the Post 2015 Development Agenda.

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
Although it may not mention women specifically, it is clear that they are part of the concerns.

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
Strengths:
- Urban–rural linkages tie together a broad range of themes and an equally broad range of actors across the territory.
- It is imperative to establish partnership of engagement at various scales (global, national, regional/ metropolitan and local) and on various urban-rural issues should be developed to enhance urban-rural linkages within the respective mandate of all partners involved, thus complementing expertise, efforts and interventions.
- There is a need for an effective partnership and networking within and across government at all levels, international agencies, research and academia, civil society and the private sector among others. It is essential to map out actors, their assets and gaps in knowledge, tools, policy and other means of implementation, and to strengthen the capacity of actors to address the gaps between urban and rural areas is also required.
Weaknesses:
- The urgent need to identify knowledge gaps especially in relation to current challenges such as climate change, disaster resilience, food security and nutrition.
- To develop guiding principles and indicators to assess trends in relation to rural – urban interactions. Tools and frameworks shall be oriented to creating effective and inclusive links throughout the territory that support and address the issues such as infrastructure and services, food security and nutrition, energy, migration, capital, goods, employment, information and technology between rural and urban territories of various sizes including metropolitan regions, networks of small - and medium-sized cities, sparsely populated areas and market towns.
// Policy interventions have been characterized by sectoral approaches by agencies or governments depending on their mandates. Different government ministries have been mandated to deal with specific urban or rural issues creating a dichotomy, and

sometimes competition between sectors, rather than an integrated and complementary approach. There has also been limited effort to develop legislative frameworks to strengthen urban-rural linkages and to ensure they serve an agenda of balanced sustainable and inclusive development. In addition cross-cutting synergies have also not been operationalized and actors have largely been implementing various thematic issues relating to urban-rural linkages.

G. General suggestions and commentary

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
The discussion started with the idea of a Urban/Rural Nexus, which might be the way to emphasize the potential of transformation that urban and rural linkages can lead to. It might be the approach that women might take.

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
- The inclusion of the women in all the levels of development.
- The investment of the state in successful programmes of urban and rural linkages to spread them at local and national level related to land tenure and housing access rights.
The urban and rural women played important role in the development of the communities but the successes obtained do not are disseminated at the national level due to the lack of political volunteer. There is important to review the housing and land politics that point out clearly the women inclusion and the results obtained.
The urban and rural women must be included in local programmes and action plans to get the communities development.

Veronica Katulushi, Zambia Homeless and Poor People's Federation
The housing policies ought to incorporate Gender issues, people with HIV/AIDS, the Disabled, old Aged, Widows, etc.
They should mostly emphasize that women's issues should be integrated in all activities and should not be isolated in special policies.

Issue Paper 11: Public Space

A. Issues missing from the paper which need to be added, particularly related to
    women

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
- Recognition of women's informal activities as elements that shape cities' public
spaces
- Safety of public places
- Public spaces as the collective memory of grassroots people

Morana M. Stipisic, Columbia University
Safety in public space and public transit for women and girls, children and youth.
(Safe access to education and workplace.)

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
This paper on Public Spaces does not address any issues related to women. Some points
such as security or parameters of usage could have been raised, regarding the
establishment and use of public space by women.

*Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el
Desarrollo (Mexico)*
• The participation of women in the management and protection of public spaces.
• Safety and women in public spaces.
• Design of public spaces and women.
• Mobility, women and public space.

B. Major points (good and bad) that relate to women

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
- Public spaces as the poor man's living room
- Empowering women by providing them with opportunities for informal economic
activities.
- Good public infrastructure allows for access (to markets, education, child support
services, etc.)

Morana M. Stipisic, Columbia University
The paper mentions that women, along with other groups, may be excluded from public
space by violence (pg 6). However there is not much mention of creating public safety
for women and other groups (eg: illumination in night, guards, etc).

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
The only point that I could relate to women is that public spaces, as common goods
can be of great help to empower women. Although it is not elaborated how. As a
result, it is hard to find a concrete relation.

*Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el
Desarrollo (Mexico)*

In the document, women are seen as one of the population groups that should have access to safe spaces but their active participation in the management and defense of these is not recognized.

C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
- Public spaces as socially inclusive and gender inclusive
- Public spaces as drivers of economic development (informal and formal) and providers of safe livelihoods
-Public spaces to be equally distributed through areas of high and low income: redistribution of municipal investments

Morana M. Stipisic, Columbia University
Safety is the critical component merely mentioned. It should be listed among the bullets of paragraphs MAIN CONCEPTS & KEY DRIVERS FOR ACTION.

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
This paper talks about empowerment of women in using a public space. Women are still considered to be kept indoors. This also addresses how use of public spaces is differentiated by gender, ethnicity and equality, which could be key factors to be beneficial to women, if focused on more.

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)
In paragraph that talks about "A city can deal with inequality through the provision of inclusive, safe and accessible public spaces," but does not specify the benefits that women would have if the term women's empowerment is integrated as an end regarding public space.
I believe that the issue of policy issues and strategies for planning, design and management of public spaces at different scales.

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
- Provides rationale for allowing informal economic activities
- Engages women in the design, provision and safety of such spaces.
- Reinforces the right to freedom of expression and assembly and direct participation in the conception of such spaces.

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
This particular paper is not really relevant to grassroots women, since it mostly focuses on the formation and usage of public spaces. However, issues that have been brought up, such as exclusion of women from using it might as well address the grassroots level.

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)

It is extremely important, because public spaces are the territories main activities are carried out, women are the ones that manage, use, and in many cases protect public spaces.

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
- Looking at public spaces development as an opportunity for collective re-invention of such spaces, engaging the grassroots in the decision making and design process leading to the creation of public places.
- Promoting public spaces as active spaces engaging women in participatory approaches.

Morana M. Stipisic, Columbia University
Could be stronger.

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
The creation of public spaces and protecting it at the same time, would be something that has to be brought under law, for making an ease of access to common users. Adequate and appropriate quality might be means of providing employment and attractive investments.

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)
The document summarizes the importance of design of public spaces, I think it would be important to strengthen the management issues and the role of women during this process

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
Does not look at public spaces as shared community memories.

Morana M. Stipisic, Columbia University
The paper mentions that women, along with other groups, may be excluded from public space by violence (pg 6). However there is not much mention of creating public safety for women and other groups (eg: illumination in night, guards, etc).

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
As for explaining the need of public space in an urban landscape, this paper fulfills criteria for addressing it duly. Also, the figurative elaboration of the amount of public spaces is effective to know.
There are more issues that are briefed, but not detailed, in terms of gender equality of the user or the socio economic exposure. These somehow, come up as the weakness in the paper.

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)

The strength is the subject of public spaces is very clear and the weakness is that it does not make visible the role of women in them.

G. General suggestions and commentary

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
Need for differentiating between Streets, Places, Parks, Playgrounds, etc. Not all public spaces are equal.

Morana M. Stipisic, Columbia University
Public safety, in particular for women and girls, children and youth should be listed among the bullets of paragraphs MAIN CONCEPTS & KEY DRIVERS FOR ACTION.

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
For a review on public spaces in general, this paper works for any group of readers. There is no specific focus on any area, that could be taken as a point of significance.

Celina Izquierdo Sánchez, Observatorio de la Gobernanza para la Cooperacion y el Desarrollo (Mexico)
The experience of women in the public space from the social role:
http://iaps.scix.net/data/contrib/att/bfe7.content.06752.pdf

Issue Paper 12: Local Economic Development

A. Issues missing from the paper which need to be added, particularly related to women

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
a) Not enough scope to broaden the definition of LED to recognize women's contribution to Local Economic Development (LED).
b) Not enough understanding of how to create an enabling environment to increase women's participation in LED .

B. Major points (good and bad) that relate to women

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
Gender-based occupational segregation persists, as does the gender pay gap; while women, including young women are more affected by unemployment and under employment. LED is important to promote a sustainable and inclusive urban economy and consequently to improve the quality of life in cities, and address inequalities, between rich and poor and also gender inequalities.
By conducting economic development at the local level, and as part of a participatory process, partnership and networks between local government, private sector (workers, employers and cooperatives), non-governmental organizations, including those representing the voice of women, youth and other local actors can be constructed and help make good decisions coordinated, broadly supported and thus durable over time.

C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
a) Recognition that women's voice is required for LED
b) Recognition of discrimination against women in terms of gender pay gap and unemployment and under-employment

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
The paper does not have an understanding of
a) Barriers and contributing factors that influence the effective participation of women in LED
b) How women's participation can contribute to LED
c) What solutions, policies and programmes can increase the effectiveness and quality of women's participation in LED

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)

Not enough. It recommends partnerships and local participatory economic development that increases the voice of women and other marginalized groups in LED. It does not say how.
Namely the importance of involving mobilized groups of women, of conducting gender needs assessments, of adequate measurements that capture women's contributions to LED, especially the invisible work that women engage in which is not acknowledged and therefore not measured.

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
Weaknesses:
a) Not enough scope to broaden the definition of LED to recognize women's contribution.
b) Not enough understanding of how to create an enabling environment to increase women's participation in LED

G. General suggestions and commentary

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
The importance of involving mobilized groups of women,
Conduct gender needs assessments,
Need for adequate measurements that capture women's contributions to LED, especially the invisible work that women engage in which is not acknowledged and therefore not measured.
Need to evolve solutions to increase women's participation in LED
Need to understand barriers to their participation and evolve policies that create an enabling environment for women's increased participation

Issue Paper 13: Jobs and Livelihoods

A. Issues missing from the paper which need to be added, particularly related to women

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
Child care, safety for women in terms of transportation, proper toilets and sanitation facilities for women and availability of water and levels of hygiene in toilets, location of toilets
The importance of having gender disaggregated data on employment, jobs, promotions, wages and so on to make informed policy decisions that address women's issues
Attitudes of management to women and the implications for opportunities for growth, promotion and skilling
Attitudes of families for paying for skill development of women and the responsibilities of women in their homes in terms of child care and elderly care
Sexual harassment as well as imbalance in power relations that has implications for an enabling environment for women and creating a glass ceiling for women to grow

B. Major points (good and bad) that relate to women

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
Women have lower labour force participation rates than men, and are overrepresented in lower paid, informal and vulnerable jobs. Legal and regulatory barriers to female participation in the labour market persist, and discrimination or traditional expectations can add further barriers. Yet relative social mobility within urban areas gives women new opportunities. Promoting gender mainstreaming in policy and programming is an essential part of urban development, and will have a significant impact. If the employment participation and wage gaps between men and women were closed, women would increase their income by up to some 76 per cent global value of US$17 trillion.

C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
Promote gender equality and women's empowerment through effective mainstreaming in policy, access to skills development and financial services.

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
Not enough focus on informal sector employment and jobs that can accommodate the needs and situation of women's responsibilities at home.
Families do not invest enough on education for the girl child. Perception of gender roles shapes the attitudes of families towards education of girls.

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
It serves to engender the workforce at higher levels.

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
Strengths:
It takes into account the concentration of women in low paid jobs and lack of access to skills, wage gaps and other forms of discrimination against women in the workforce.
Weaknesses:
It does not take into account conditions at the grassroots because some issues are unaddressed a) basic attitudinal changes of families towards women b) looking at improving work conditions in the informal sector c) increasing income generation opportunities for women through access to credit and skills development at the grassroots.

G. General suggestions and commentary

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
For poor families, having scholarships for young girls or access to educational loans would be an important intervention at the grassroots, particularly for skills development.
Conduct a gender needs assessment on how to improve economic opportunities and access to resources for poor women given their situations including domestic responsibilities and other barriers.
Facilitate grassroots women innovations on economic interventions that improve their access to incomes and upscale these solutions through creating policies and programmes that support their innovations.

Issue Paper 14: Informal Sector

A. Issues missing from the paper which need to be added, particularly related to women

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
Difficulty in ensuring safety for women particularly sexual harassment
Lack of infrastructure for women vendors or women working in public areas in terms of affordable transport, proper sanitation and water facilities, child care facilities.
Lack of hygienic conditions for women and their children which impacts their health and that of their families
Harassment by police is a major issue where women vendors and others occupying on public spaces are made to pay higher fees and are exploited more by police and local elected officials.

Ann Wanjiru, GROOTS Kenya
- How grassroots women's needs and challenges can feature in resolutions and policy framing reports.
- Women feature in the facts sheets but not in the final report.

B. Major points (good and bad) that relate to women

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
It recognizes that women are located more in the informal sector than the formal sector. It recognizes further that higher proportions of women relative to men are part of the informal economy in most countries.
Difficulty exercising fundamental rights.

Ann Wanjiru, GROOTS Kenya
This point is good --- Many slum dwellers work in the informal economy. Their homes are often used for production/storing of goods and or for direct retail.
Slum upgrading and low-cost housing initiatives need to be mindful of strengthening livelihood activities.

C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
Recognition of
a) women's location in the informal economy.
b) More women than men work in vulnerable, low-paid, or undervalued jobs
c) Difficulty in enforcing labour laws making sure that women have decent work conditions

Ann Wanjiru, GROOTS Kenya
Many slum dwellers work in the informal economy. Their homes are often used for production / storing of goods and or for direct retail. Slum upgrading and low-cost housing initiatives need to be mindful of strengthening livelihood activities.

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
The relevance of the paper is it recognizes that women are concentrated in the informal sector and that it is difficult to address the issues faced by them.

Ann Wanjiru, GROOTS Kenya
It is relevant to women when it mentions grassroots communities as women form part of communities. Beyond that it says very little on women.

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
Not sufficiently unless it demands gender disaggregated data for women in the informal sector to ensure more inclusive gender sensitive decision making for policies and programmes.

Ann Wanjiru, GROOTS Kenya
If the status of grassroots women was featured more, including roles they play and could play.

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
Strengths: Key elements to address the challenges of informality are strengthening the representation and voice of informal economy workers and formalization to reduce vulnerabilities and open access to key services, appropriate regulation, labour and environmental monitoring, licensing and taxation.
No understanding of how to engender the key elements namely a) ensuring voice and representation of women b) identifying and prioritizing vulnerabilities faced specifically by women for example sexual harassment, lack of affordable and safe child care facilities, lack of sanitation facilities that also address the issue of menstrual hygiene.
The overall weaknesses are lack of attention to surfacing detailed problems women face in the informal sector and to solutions for women in the informal economy.

G. General suggestions and commentary

Sangeetha Purushothaman, Huairou Commission and Best Practices Foundation (India)
Needs assessment of women for which disaggregated data is needed on women and the informal economy
Women need to be mobilized to make them aware of their rights and entitlements
Women need a platform where they can express their needs and their issues addressed
Women's innovations on participation in decision making on public facilities such as toilets and safe transport

Grassroots women are primarily responsible for children and need child care facilities that are safe, clean and affordable.

Ann Wanjiru, GROOTS Kenya
Empower roles that grassroots women play in community development to maximize overall results.

Issue Paper 15: Urban Resilience

Sandra Denisse Herrera Flores, MIRA (Mexico)
In every society, women and men have distinct socially constructed roles and responsibilities, needs and knowledge, all of which are essential to understand and integrate actions to be taken in crisis and to guarantee the resilience of a city.

Emma Porio, Ateneo de Manila University
The chapter outlines very well the basic components of urban resilience but treats the issue, largely in physical and technical terms and lack sensitivity to the fact that people's/women's groups innovations contribute greatly to making urban systems resilient!

Sandra Denisse Herrera Flores, MIRA (Mexico)
The shocks and stresses affect different women and men, no matter if these come from Natural, Technological or socio-economic-political-cultural hazards.

Emma Porio, Ateneo de Manila University
This chapter lacks sensitivity to the contributions of women's groups to making the urban systems resilient.

Sandra Denisse Herrera Flores, MIRA (Mexico)
The resilience itself: how to enable a city to withstand and recover quickly from multiple and varied shocks and stresses.

Sandra Denisse Herrera Flores, MIRA (Mexico)
It is relevant because to recover the urban system, not only physically but related to people, the action of grassroots women is very important.

Emma Porio, Ateneo de Manila University
Any document that defines/outlines the drivers of urban resilience is extremely important to vulnerable groups like grassroots women. But this document does not seem to recognize that grassroots women are at the forefront of resilience-building initiatives in the global South.

Emma Porio, Ateneo de Manila University
As of now, not very much!

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Sandra Denisse Herrera Flores, MIRA (Mexico)
It should have more examples related to socio-economic-political-cultural shocks and
stresses.

Emma Porio, Ateneo de Manila University
The chapter provides excellent facts and figures to illustrate the dimensions of
urban resilience. While the chapter recognizes that poor households are most
vulnerable to risks, it seemed to ignore that poor, women-headed are highly more at
risk! More significantly, it does not recognize that women in vulnerable communities
contribute a lot to supporting their cities/urban systems function!

G. General suggestions and commentary

Sandra Denisse Herrera Flores, MIRA (Mexico)
There are experience and publications about how to engender an agenda with WEDO and
IUCN.

Emma Porio, Ateneo de Manila University
The value of this document will become greater if it recognizes the
contributions of women's groups, especially those from vulnerable communities
are recognized.

Suranjana Gupta, Huairou Commission
There is no mention of the role of local communities and how they contribute
to building urban resilience, nor is there any mention of organized groups of
women and their efforts to reduce the shocks and stresses felt by low income
and poor urban communities.
It is important to understand how urban development processes can and are
easily becoming major drivers of urban risk.

Issue Paper 16: Urban Ecosystems and Resource Management

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
The grassroots women participation as advocators in land and housing access rights programmes at local and national level.

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
Key concepts do not make specific references to some and the grassroots. The paper is technical, but it acknowledges that it should be seen in relationships to other Issue Papers (# 6; 8; 10; 11; 15; and 17).

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
Good points related to women in land property and housing access rights:
- The decision-making of grassroots women with the approval of housing politics at the national level
The women took the leadership and changed the situation in communities that were leaded for more than 35 years by men without infrastructure services with strong problems of delinquency and drugs.
The grassroots women formed and strength their organizations at the local and national level to be heard from the state and local authorities in the process of advocacy will start at the national level to approve laws related to land property and housing access rights.
- The grassroots women leaders from 12 Provinces and 13 districts of Lima city formed a National Organization in demand for land property and housing access rights.
- The grassroots women empowered after built their capacities are able to dialogue and negotiate with local and state authorities to get the supporting required in benefit of their communities.
- The grassroots women trained in land property and housing access rights is able to implement the tools and strategies they created to advocate the state and local authorities to get the results they need to live safe.
Bad points:
- The presence of the male problem that is more present in the provinces of Peru. But the women are able to stop these barriers that interrupt the progress of the communities.
- The lack of supporting from the members of Parliament (Housing Committee) that sometimes identify the based organizations as political one.
- The Familiar violence that the women suffer mostly in poor communities due to the lack of capacity building programmes.

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York

Green infrastructure, Ecosystem Services, Disaster risk reduction, Health and Recreation, Infrastructure savings, etc. It emphasizes that "citizens need to connect with nature and benefit from that connection".

C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
Women advocators in land property and housing access rights, women community managenet groups to advocate for their rights, parliamentarians engaged with grassroots women's demands for land property and housing rights. Local government's engagement with the demand of the women to get cities resilient. The participation of the women in local programmes related to land sanitation to get the titling of the land. The participation of the women in decision-making process of the local government programmes approval.

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
- Ecosystem-based management of cities
- Sustainable management and use of natural resources
- Minimizing energy consumption and waste generation
- Strategic regional planning as basis for urban planning

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
Women's participation in all the levels of development of the communities. The engagement of the women at the local level to benefit their communities.

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
Very relevant, as they benefit from a reestablished connection with the ecosystem (health, disaster mitigation, food production, recreation areas, etc.)

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
To engender the New Urban Agenda is important to engage the women signing a document targeting about what role they will play as advocators to the state and local government to get the results required for example the approval of the Anti-Eviction law proposal. To get the results what is important to do is to dialogue and negotiate with the Housing Committee members of Parliament. The women need to be faced as National Women Organization fighting for their rights in land and housing access and against familiar violence as well.

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York

The integration consideration of the ecosystem in regional and urban planning can lead to new urban design solutions.

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
The strength of this paper is to show how capable is the women to get the development of the communities. The weaknesses include the lack of information required to show how the women is able to change the situation of the communities and become a leader of the communities. As a comment I think that we need to strength more women to get safe and resilient cities.

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
It would benefit from analysis of examples.

G. General suggestions and commentary

Luz Maria Sanchez Hurtado, NGO Estrategia, Centre of Investigation and Action for Urban Development (Peru)
My general suggestion is to start exchanging of experiences between grassroots women for example from India and Peru to make comparisons and learn each other. The women in Peru have different realities from the Coast, Mountains and Jungle of Peru due to the location of the communities that mostly occupy vulnerable areas. In India they have their own rules and have different way to solve the problem to access to a land property and housing as well.
Comment: This is a good opportunity to link between women from different continents and learn about tools and strategies the women drive to replicate the good practices and change the life of the women.

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
Although women are not necessarily mentioned, it is clear that focusing on the Ecosystem will benefit them at all levels. The other Issue Papers that this paper relates to are full of references to women and the grassroots.

Issue Paper 17: Cities and Climate Change and Disaster Risk Management

A. Issues missing from the paper which need to be added, particularly related to women

Martha Teresa González Renteria, Centro de Atención a la Mujer Trabajadora de Chihuahua A.C. (Mexico)
Vulnerability – mitigation adaptation and financing to climate change from a gendered perspective.

Joyce Yu, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
Under Issues Summary, in reference to Inequalities, gender inequalities need to be noted and their impacts.

Emma Porio, Ateneo de Manila University
This paper lacks a gender perspective in examining climate change and disaster management. In particular, vulnerability can be further refined if socially-differentiated by social location.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
p.4 good paragraph on urban inequalities and vulnerabilities under the KNOWLEDGE section - but should add gender to socioeconomic variables listed in parenthesis.
Also, should add the importance of local knowledge in dealing with disaster risks and adaptation should be added here
p.5 good first sentence under ENGAGEMENT - at least mentions women. But again nothing about the reluctance of governments and experts in incorporating their knowledge and providing resources and support to enhance their capacities. Engagement is assumed to happen automatically in all the reports.
Under POLICY on p. 6 - National government commitment is essential but it is not only collaboration and cooperation at all levels of government (and especially support and financing of local governments) but participation of communities is also critical. They are the first responders and their important roles (and the need to support and resource local initiatives) should be emphasized here.
p.9 URBAN GOVERNANCE Assumes again that all groups in the society have equal power and resources for "effective interface"!!! No mention of how to deal with power, resource and information inequalities.

Quazi Baby, Participatory Development Action Program-PDAP (Bangladesh)
Climate change is an important issue especially in developing countries. Mostly women are affected during disaster. But I did not see any women involvement either in decision making or reducing disaster.

B. Major points (good and bad) that relate to women

Martha Teresa González Renteria, Centro de Atención a la Mujer Trabajadora de Chihuahua A.C. (Mexico)
The disasters of climate change are located mainly in the most vulnerable population; dependence on land for food, illiteracy, lack of social protection, factors that are recurrently by inequality and discrimination in women.

Joyce Yu, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
Under engagement, women are listed as a specific group for consideration. The role of local governments is emphasized though the role of local communities could be strengthened. This paper is very top down government centric approach with either national or local government as the key player.

Emma Porio, Ateneo de Manila University
The section on vulnerability that recognizes its socially-differentiated nature could be a good beginning for a gendered approach to climate vulnerability and disaster risk reduction and management.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
Government commitment and effective mitigation and adaptation policies are very important. But the whole paper is written from a very top down and technical perspective. Does not acknowledge the invaluable roles local communities and grassroots groups can play in adaptation and preparedness and recovery.

Quazi Baby, Participatory Development Action Program-PDAP (Bangladesh)
During Disaster, women have to suffer a lot. Men do not stay long time at home, but women have to look after their children, elder parents, household items (mainly food, water etc). But this paper I did not see any recognition of women and how women can involve during planning of disaster risk management.

C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Martha Teresa González Renteria, Centro de Atención a la Mujer Trabajadora de Chihuahua A.C. (Mexico)
Women to climate change are not vulnerable by nature, but because of their status and position of gender discrimination. Climate change must include areas of economic, scientific and human rights with a gender perspective; develop capacity for adaptation and mitigation and climate change financing to be in decision making , a situation that will allow them to leave the state of vulnerability.
The visions and decisions that take into account human rights with a gender perspective.

Emma Porio, Ateneo de Manila University
The key drivers for action would have been beneficial for women had it recognized the contributions of women to the advancement of disaster risk management and climate solutions.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
Local governments should be resourced and their capacity should be built - they are more accessible for grassroots women.
Infrastructure investments are important but does that mean big construction companies will get the $$$? What about local initiatives for adaptation?
Coordination and cooperation at all levels - but local community level is not mentioned.

Mention of importance of participation and inclusion - very short but is there - should be expanded.

Quazi Baby, Participatory Development Action Program-PDAP (Bangladesh)
1. Grassroots Women involvement during Planning and monitoring
2. Budget allocation for the vulnerable women
3. Create job opportunity for the affected women
4. Arrange transport provision in disaster risk area
5. Wise management of land and improve preparedness for future

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Martha Teresa González Renteria, Centro de Atención a la Mujer Trabajadora de Chihuahua A.C. (Mexico)
A high degree of relevance, if the document takes up the proposal to include women in decision-making to climate change.

Joyce Yu, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
The paper is extremely dry and lacks a real vision of the future. It is heavy on jargon and multidimensional approach with little data on examples of success. Drivers section is changed to "Operations". It avoids the central issue of political will and leadership. Perfect policies do not mean nor lead to guarantee good implementation.

Emma Porio, Ateneo de Manila University
This would have been extremely relevant to grassroots women if this paper had been gendered in its approach.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
It is very relevant topic but pays little attention to women/gender aspects and the role of local communities in disaster management.

Quazi Baby, Participatory Development Action Program-PDAP (Bangladesh)
Most non-relevance is that there is no budget allocation for grassroots women at the municipality or city-corporation level. Besides, paper is written in general way. Women worded only once. So many data have been mentioned, but there is no data about the women involvement during disaster risk reduction.

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Joyce Yu, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
The New Urban Agenda principles of Compactness are seen as a useful strategy to mitigate impacts of climate change and disaster risk management and Inclusiveness as a decision-making approach. The paper makes several key references to NUA.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
Needs to be written with a gender perspective.

Quazi Baby, Participatory Development Action Program-PDAP (Bangladesh)

Discuss with experienced women leader who were involved during disaster. Need proper training on leadership and disaster risk management. Need to inform local level planning and involve grassroots women leaders in planning process.
There should be needed well planned shelter home where separate toilet and water facilities would be set up for the women.

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Martha Teresa González Renteria, Centro de Atención a la Mujer Trabajadora de Chihuahua A.C. (Mexico)
It is dealt with enough statistical data and conceptually defines climate change.

Joyce Yu, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
Does not have a sense of reality in terms of challenges that national and local governments face in implementing climate related policies and regulations. Corruption at local government level is not mentioned and is a serious obstacle in any infrastructural investment -soft or hard. The paper deals mainly with adaptation and not mitigation where most governments are actually investing.

Emma Porio, Ateneo de Manila University
Lacking gender-sensitivity, especially with regards to vulnerable grassroots women.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
Very technical and top down. Focus on financial issues - important but not very people centered approach. Does not acknowledge the importance of supporting resourcing local communities and grassroots women's initiatives in creating resilient communities.
Does not pay sufficient attention to social and economic aspects of residency. (Sustainability 3 E's include not only Environment, Economy but also Equity - something that should be emphasized throughout the paper) Focus is on technical and civil defense measures. IPPC quotations show that the scientists seem to be more aware of the role of communities (there is an add-on under Inclusion and participation section) and importance of dealing with the social and economic vulnerabilities (minor mention at the bottom of p. 9 and top of p. 10).

Quazi Baby, Participatory Development Action Program-PDAP (Bangladesh)
The paper is not helpful for the vulnerable women. I did not see any strength for the women. Only some references and data have been mentioned, which is not sufficient.

G. General suggestions and commentary

Martha Teresa González Renteria, Centro de Atención a la Mujer Trabajadora de Chihuahua A.C. (Mexico)
How effective is this paper? It contains data and complete explanations on the subject of climate change and disasters, but does not distinguish the different realities that women and men are facing the impacts and mitigation and adaptation. What is your overall evaluation of this paper in terms of its value to grassroots women? It is a job which is not analyzed from a gender perspective

To what extent is this paper engendered? It is not, assumes that spending to address disaster impacts on diseases is equally for men and women
To what extent does this paper address women's empowerment? No gender difference impacts on climate change, not include actions to move the women's position and gender condition

Emma Porio, Ateneo de Manila University
Engender this paper.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
The whole paper needs to be edited to include gender perspective.

Quazi Baby, Participatory Development Action Program-PDAP (Bangladesh)
As we worked in urban area of Bangladesh in a poor communities, we have come to know that women can lead the community and manage the disaster situation through their knowledge and hard work. Men are always try escape, but women cannot move without taking children and old people. They try to take shelter in safe place. But government needs to take action for the girls and women to ensure security and safety.
Government should take some plan for making multi storied building for the urban poor women, those are living in the slum area.

Issue Paper 18: Urban Infrastructure and Basic Services, including energy

    A. Issues missing from the paper which need to be added, particularly related to women

Ernestina Patricia Castillo Limón, Fundación Trina AC. Desarrollo Humano y Social (Mexico)
The funding for a single woman has to have points to support the acquisition of decent housing.

    B. Major points (good and bad) that relate to women

Ernestina Patricia Castillo Limón, Fundación Trina AC. Desarrollo Humano y Social (Mexico)
Good, care for the environment; bad, that women consume many natural resources.

    C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Ernestina Patricia Castillo Limón, Fundación Trina AC. Desarrollo Humano y Social (Mexico)
Protect the environment, we all benefit
The construction of housing in strategically well-located land for women to live

    D. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Ernestina Patricia Castillo Limón, Fundación Trina AC. Desarrollo Humano y Social (Mexico)
In paragraph mentioned infrastructure it is composed not only of physical assets but sewed into three main asset concepts, knowledge and institutions and understanding the three concepts can be advanced in a database functioning of society with gender equality.

    E. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Ernestina Patricia Castillo Limón, Fundación Trina AC. Desarrollo Humano y Social (Mexico)
Use of natural resources, green urban housing is excellent, add the use of solar energy for public lighting not only at home but in the home environment.

    F. General suggestions and commentary

Ernestina Patricia Castillo Limón, Fundación Trina AC. Desarrollo Humano y Social (Mexico)

The idea of protecting the environment is excellent because a healthy world is not just where we build a house.

Issue Paper 19: Transport and Mobility

    A. Issues missing from the paper which need to be added, particularly related to women

Mtra. Olga Amparo Dávila Espinoza, Asociación de Mujeres Profesionistas de Tamaulipas, Reynosa A.C. (Mexico)
Special public transportation for women as taxis, and a number guaranty of places in public transportation and place to parking lot.

    B. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Mtra. Olga Amparo Dávila Espinoza, Asociación de Mujeres Profesionistas de Tamaulipas, Reynosa A.C. (Mexico)
It is free of gender. Is for human kind. It requires that we consider the specific needs and interests of women in the use and transportation planning, and mobility within the city.

    C. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Mtra. Olga Amparo Dávila Espinoza, Asociación de Mujeres Profesionistas de Tamaulipas, Reynosa A.C. (Mexico)
One weakness that does not talk about the role of the woman in the sustainable indicator.
A great strength is the use of technology in real time data and how it is accessible to people inside the public transportation.

    D. General suggestions and commentary

Mtra. Olga Amparo Dávila Espinoza, Asociación de Mujeres Profesionistas de Tamaulipas, Reynosa A.C. (Mexico)
Develop and add value from the point of view that women as men we have to develop communities, and the multi modal transportations must be green and minimum cost. The urban and rural towns must be plan and redesign to be able to live in humanitarian way. Be able to reach supplies in an easy for be able to reduce the pollutions impact.

Issue Paper 20: Housing

A. Issues missing from the paper which need to be added, particularly related to women

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
- Access to land, credit, tenure is still not as available to women/grassroots
- Transparency is mentioned but participation to decision re housing is not made an integral part of the process.
- It raises the issue of climate appropriateness and energy efficiency, but does not detail solutions.

Joyce Nangobi Rosemary, Slum Women's Initiative for Development (Uganda)
There is need to highlight women as a special interest group of people clearly point out and vividly show their involved in this paper. The paper is a lot of generalization which may hinder the consideration of women as a special group of people to focus on.

Cintia Esther Lozada Delgado, Pensadoras Urbanas (Mexico)
Gender perspective

Joyce Yu, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
Under Key Facts, specific stats/reference to the disproportionate impact on women of Exposure to hazards and health threatening factors would position women's needs more prominently.
Under Issue Summary, Accurate forecasting is noted as a major weakness. Gender analysis and data collection should be noted as a major issue under Accurate Forecasting.
Under Drivers, Capacity building of communities especially women's leadership would counter balance the power of elites, developers, etc.

Alejandro de Castro Mazarro, Columbia University
It would be good to know if women are majority of mortgage holders in low-income areas, which may point to social burdens or leading positions.

Mirna Guadalupe Fiol Higuera, MIRA (Mexico)
Exclusion and discrimination against women on issues related to housing.
Unpaid work of women by the lack of access to services.
Information disaggregated by sex that accounts for gender inequalities.

B. Major points (good and bad) that relate to women

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
- Emphasis on private sector which does not necessarily reaches out to the very low income, including women
- Security of tenure not yet achieved.
- Property rights have not reduced levels of poverty
- Participation of women to planning, regional or local, not emphasized

Joyce Nangobi Rosemary, Slum Women's Initiative for Development (Uganda)
There is a challenge in sustainable development of this paper, there is no highlights
on how finances will be raised to meet the high demand to 50 million adequate houses
to the over increasing global population.

Cintia Esther Lozada Delgado, Pensadoras Urbanas (Mexico)
The poorest and vulnerable households are the most affected as they have been
untouched by the housing market and limitedly benefited from housing policies and
regulations. Efforts to improve access to adequate housing for women, migrants,
refugees, people with disabilities, indigenous and minorities have made little
progress so far.

Joyce Yu, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
The failure of land titles to contribute to poverty eradication is a serious point
made and the lack of accompanying services that do not necessarily become available
to the poor who might have formal land titles. Importance of quality rental
regulations including subsidies is especially important for poor women and features
in this paper.

Mirna Guadalupe Fiol Higuera, MIRA (Mexico)
The paper identifies specific problems and needs of women in the 7 components that UN
signals for "adequate housing":
Legal security of tenure	Habitability	Affordability
Availability of services	Accessibility	Cultural adequacy
Affordability		

C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
- New emphasis on rental housing, which increases mobility and access to livelihood
opportunities for women
- Need for an inclusive planning process
- Rental housing can accommodate gender and cultural concerns and strengthen socio-
economic networks

Joyce Nangobi Rosemary, Slum Women's Initiative for Development (Uganda)
The emphasis on enabling the poor to help themselves has contributed to the
acknowledgement of local initiatives led by women led organizations formed and run by
the urban poor or inadequately housed. Their responses have been more focused on
local needs and problems, taking account of local ideas and based on local
understanding, such as incremental approaches to housing, community planning and
savings, micro-finance and informal property markets.

Cintia Esther Lozada Delgado, Pensadoras Urbanas (Mexico)
Increase subsidies and incentives on the supply side as well as various forms of
possible demand-driven subsidies without shifting the focus from the most poor and
vulnerable groups.
Technical, legislative and financial efforts shall be focused to progressively
realizing the right to adequate housing for all and especially the most poor,

vulnerable and minority groups, while also addressing aspects of participation, non-discrimination, security of tenure, transparency and accountability.

Joyce Yu, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
The paper posits achievement of human rights as the central force for housing policy.

Mirna Guadalupe Fiol Higuera, MIRA (Mexico)
The fulfillment of the conditions for adequate housing and the ability to access alternative credit to consider their ability to pay.

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
- It clarifies the ways housing, poverty, and livelihood interact and recognizes the value of the informal sector networks in creating social capital
- It accepts the fact that housing development is incremental

Joyce Nangobi Rosemary, Slum Women's Initiative for Development (Uganda)
Knowledge has improved the ways housing and, poverty and livelihood interact. A wealth of empirical evidence has contributed to the understanding of how low-income people mobilize resources and organize themselves to access land and housing often drawing on the informal sector and networks of social capital. Housing provide increased security, a potential source of income-generating activities and, if well serviced and appropriately located, it allows for inclusion, better living conditions and access to livelihood opportunities.
Non-inclusion of women in research or data collection to give empirical evidence of women in those un-planned settlements.

Cintia Esther Lozada Delgado, Pensadoras Urbanas (Mexico)
The focus on the most poor and vulnerable groups.

Joyce Yu, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
If everything in this paper were accomplished, I am not certain that women's status within a country would change. The status of women in Singapore is better than elsewhere but still is not equal and they have great housing!! In fact, grassroots women's leadership is hard to find since the basic need of good housing is guaranteed. Women's groups focus on violence, worker rights, social laws.

Mirna Guadalupe Fiol Higuera, MIRA (Mexico)
It is relevant in that both policy and programs comply with the requirements of adequate housing considering the gender perspective.

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
By using the analysis of specific grassroots - led housing development to demonstrate the value (and creativity) of enabling the poor to help themselves

Joyce Nangobi Rosemary, Slum Women's Initiative for Development (Uganda)
Inclusion of women, youth and men in urban planning, implementation and monitoring of land administration and management, and adequate housing.
Strengthening land policies and educating masses on urban land rights and adequate housing.

Cintia Esther Lozada Delgado, Pensadoras Urbanas (Mexico)
To provide security and welfare for women

Mirna Guadalupe Fiol Higuera, MIRA (Mexico)
The issue of housing is a human rights issue and priority for the welfare and development of women.

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
Weakness: Reliance on private sector

Joyce Nangobi Rosemary, Slum Women's Initiative for Development (Uganda)
The paper clearly expresses the facts about inadequate housing globally as highlighted by the fact that Governments interference in the housing sector has been very minimal and many have almost withdrawn from land provision, land supply, procurement, servicing and even regulation.
The World Bank's contribution is also minimal as shown in the figures provided in the paper.
Government and World Bank would be the primary entities to provide a first hand in this initiative rather than distancing themselves from that fact.

Cintia Esther Lozada Delgado, Pensadoras Urbanas (Mexico)
Strength: Includes vulnerable groups.
Weakness: Does not explicitly mention women.

Alejandro de Castro Mazarro, Columbia University
This issue paper discusses "affordable" and "adequate" housing, but does not fully address "housing" as a broader issue. I.e. the paper does not mention gentrification, nor the real estate burst of 2009, of which we experience the problem of foreclosures and abandonment.
The environmental discussion of the paper (last bullet point of Key Drivers) is very similar to the one at the HABITAT I conference in 1976, and it seems very hard to imagine how it can lead to proper policy units that deal with climate change in the next 20 years. The contribution to the carbon footprint is exponentially higher in formal housing (structure made of reinforced concrete, etc), and this should also be discussed, since the paper only addresses how to be environmentally friendly for the lower income segment of population.
It is unclear what figures 1 and 2 add to the discussion at the paper.

Mirna Guadalupe Fiol Higuera, MIRA (Mexico)
The strength is that it is part of a comprehensive vision and its weakness is that it does not consider the gender perspective.

G. General suggestions and commentary

Ghislaine Hermanuz, City College of New York
Women are seen as part of the "most poor and vulnerable" but not as partners in the development process
Many of the provisions proposed, like site-and-services, are not new nor are there new ideas to accelerate construction.
The paper is informative but does not explore new territories.

Joyce Nangobi Rosemary, Slum Women's Initiative for Development (Uganda)
The paper is generally good especially if the targeted interest group is included in the whole process.

Alejandro de Castro Mazarro, Columbia University
The reference to the private sector should be discussed at key facts, and the paper should be more open about the pros and cons of the financialization of housing. The paper could use the concept of the "right to housing" to clarify that it does not see housing as a service provision, but as a right.

Mirna Guadalupe Fiol Higuera, MIRA (Mexico)
It is suggested to integrate housing and gender relationships; discrimination and historical exclusion of women in issues related to housing, such as: land tenure, access to a living wage that allows the affordability of housing and the working hours of unpaid work of women that is overloaded with lack of access to services, since the space of housing, domestic space has been in detention for women. Integrate disaggregated data by sex accounting for gender inequalities in housing issues.

Issue Paper 21: Smart Cities

Emerson Augusto Lozada Delgado, Pensadoras Urbanas (Mexico)
The inclusion of women as an element of change in Smart cities, how to listen their needs and their opinions for an effective development of a smart city.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
The first part is totally focused on new technologies and economic growth and efficiency. No gender, race or class concerns at all - reference to businesses and citizens without any mention of who the "citizens" are -- in some countries women do not have all the rights of citizenship, such as land/property ownership! It seems as it is written mainly for "developed countries". Interestingly, at the end they admit that there is no clear definition of what "smart cities" mean and that it should be decided contextually (i.e., business as usual". No mention of the digital divide until the latter section of the paper or the threat of such strategies taking resources away from the marginalized groups! This sounds like an approach that will make the increasing inequalities in cities even worse!!!

Josefina Guzman A., Universidad Autónoma de Tamaulipas (Mexico)
The relationship of women with the use of ICT

B. Major points (good and bad) that relate to women

Emerson Augusto Lozada Delgado, Pensadoras Urbanas (Mexico)
Women have been left aside in this issue paper.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
Only one reference in the latter part of paper to "women" (p.7) and another to "vulnerable and marginalized groups" (p.8 I assume women are included in there!!!) in relation to "developing countries."
First bullet point on p. 7 is good.
Item 4 on p. 5 on "connectivity" is good but no specific mention of women there - should be added.
It is not clear how "smart" approaches can automatically help achieve the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) on making cities and humans settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable." They themselves admit this in 2nd bullet on p.6. Also there is a reference to "the need to consider human rights in development of each city" - should add women's rights to this.

C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Emerson Augusto Lozada Delgado, Pensadoras Urbanas (Mexico)
There a few to none ideas in this paper regarding development or inclusion for women.

The development of ICTs platforms in an accessible way for grassroots women in places that they use to visit daily like school, government centers, public spaces like parks and plazas.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
The notion of using new technologies to make cities more resilient and sustainable is fine. But there is no concern about how the benefits would be distributed! The concern here is clearly not grassroots women or low income communities!

Josefina Guzman A., Universidad Autónoma de Tamaulipas (Mexico)
The idea of a strategic urban planning involved in all sectors of society
Having cohesive, orderly, sustainable, participatory cities

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Emerson Augusto Lozada Delgado, Pensadoras Urbanas (Mexico)
Since grassroots women know from firsthand the needs of their community the relevance of this paper is very important, grassroots women must be considered in first place to develop a smart city.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
The whole concept ignores grassroots women. Very technical and top down. Without any mention of specific measures to ensure training and resourcing of grassroots women and low income communities to access such technologies, it is absolutely irrelevant. But if such measures added, it may be relevant.

Josefina Guzman A., Universidad Autónoma de Tamaulipas (Mexico)
The relevance in the idea that women and other minority groups make an important role in cities.

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Emerson Augusto Lozada Delgado, Pensadoras Urbanas (Mexico)
First of all, we must consider the inclusion of the grassroots women and their growth in the smart cities agenda. Since grassroots women in Latin America most of the time lack for educational preparation, the ICT platforms must be created with that in mind. The development of said platforms must be focused in a friendly User interface so they can gain a quick grip and access this tools confidently in order to evolve along with the smart cities.

Josefina Guzman A., Universidad Autónoma de Tamaulipas (Mexico)
In the idea of the participation of all sectors of society in the planning of cities.

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Emerson Augusto Lozada Delgado, Pensadoras Urbanas (Mexico)

A subtopic must be taken account regarding the inclusion of grassroots women and their integration in the smart city agenda as an element of change.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
It is a badly written paper - different sections seem to be written by different authors. The concept is extremely vague - or rather simply focused on adoption of new technologies for economic growth and for making cities more efficient and competitive. Later it is added on about the need not to neglect the informal sector, urban rural continuum, etc. in making such huge investments is just lip service. There is no concern to really spread the benefits of new technology to low income communities, let alone grassroots women. I do not see any strength, really!

Josefina Guzman A., Universidad Autónoma de Tamaulipas (Mexico)
The strength lies in the idea of a strategic planning of cities.
A weakness is the lack of concrete actions to implement the proposal.

G. General suggestions and commentary

Emerson Augusto Lozada Delgado, Pensadoras Urbanas (Mexico)
We need to consider more the people that live in the cities rather that the infrastructure, the infrastructure is a major topic to take in account but infrastructures are made by and for people.

Ayse Yonder, Pratt Institute
1) Should add consideration of distributional aspects of adopting new technologies to urban administration.
2) Should articulate specific measures to ensure training and resourcing of grassroots women and low income communities to access such technologies
3) Add women and vulnerable groups whenever they mention "citizens" or "stakeholders" - to be inclusive.
4) Add women's rights, when they mention "the need to consider human rights in development of each city"

Issue Paper 22: Informal Settlements

A. Issues missing from the paper which need to be added, particularly related to women

Joyce Yu, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
Under the Drivers section, Government Leadership is highlighted and noted throughout the document and the importance of engagement of slum dwellers, et. al. in all levels of planning, development, et. al. however, community leadership is needed if any of the participatory approaches being promoted have a chance to be successful. This element of empowering the poor and particularly women should be a Driver alongside Government.
The pervasive issue of violence in informal settlements is totally ignored. Crime, drugs, domestic violence, rape can permeate the life of informal settlement and slums. The depravation of safety threatens women and girls 24/7. A reference to conflict is noted at the end of the paper. However, it refers possibly to political military conflict.

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
There is a very insignificant portion in the review, where it address that women having lower education level are enforced with gender inequality issues. If that is the case, there should have been an extensive discussion on how women are not considered in the decision making group, regarding settlements or how their economic status could be upgraded. The following issues could have been added on a more detail basis:
- Education
- Health and
- Social security

Alejandro de Castro Mazarro, Columbia University
There should be more key drivers for action that relate to redistributive justice measures. Some slum root causes are related to exclusion, but initiatives mentioned only tackle the provision of services.

Ann Wanjiru, GROOTS Kenya
- Deeper understanding of the role of grassroots women in informal settlements in regard to community development
- Greater appreciation of these roles

B. Major points (good and bad) that relate to women

Joyce Yu, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
Whilst disadvantages of slum dwellers is amply noted the paper lacks any gender analysis where women are starkly the most vulnerable and ridiculous statements featuring women suffer from teen pregnancies as a key impact. Power issues are noted but no reference to gender power relations as endemic and its impact. As the paper emphasizes physical issues, such as socio spatial exclusion, but there is no mention on how women are affected disproportionately due to gender ""disadvantages"".
Informal sector jobs are noted but no reference to the wellknown fact that women make

up this important sector and how policies must centre upon women's access to formal employment and how informal workers can be better protected and other issues. Government leadership in policies, regulations, planning mechanisms is emphasized to counter private sector trends however, it skirts the truth that enabling environments in housing issues have failed. The paper emphasizes government as the convener and not the regulator, creator, builder, empowering people to create the solutions. It should go further in this regard to place Government at the centre of the housing crisis.

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
The issue of being low on education scale and higher marginalization rates are lightly addressed, although it doesn't give a very specific idea on how these drawbacks are handled (or mishandled) by the targeted group.

Alejandro de Castro Mazarro, Columbia University
Women are seen as part of the most vulnerable groups at slums, but there is no reference that women have in housing microcredits, and also their role (and challenges) in community participation at informal settlements.

Ann Wanjiru, GROOTS Kenya
This point is good ---- Specific groups are affected by living in these informal environments.
For example, a) Women are vulnerable to many hazards and environmental stressors in these contexts and are also more likely to have very low education levels and higher rates of teen pregnancies.

C. Key ideas that are beneficial to women and relevant to women's issues

Joyce Yu, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
The emphasis on a rights-based approach and the protection of human rights as an integral part of any solution is noteworthy and positive.
Positioning of informal settlement and slum dwellers in all processes and acknowledgement of their expertise and knowledge is a strength of the paper.
Peer Learning Platforms is featured as a Driver however, it does not happen without leadership capacity building and essential infrastructural (organizational and physical) foundations. The role of women is well documented in community learning roles.

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
Since this paper talks about the existence of informal settlements on a broad scale, I think the participation of women in organizing the community, participatory planning to be specific, could have been a major issue. That, in a nutshell, would have compiled vital facts hidden within.

Ann Wanjiru, GROOTS Kenya
Undertaking upgrading processes in informal settlement and slums that utilize participatory planning mechanisms which coordinate and engage all relevant urban stakeholders, including the inhabitants themselves.

Specific groups are affected by living in these informal environments. For example, a) Women are vulnerable to many hazards and environmental stressors in these contexts and are also more likely to have very low education levels and higher rates of teen pregnancies.

Accurate and available informal settlement and slum data, learning platforms and knowledge sharing across all scales, remain limited and ad hoc.

D. Relevance or non-relevance to grassroots women

Joyce Yu, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
Issues of empowerment, grassroots knowledge and expertise, participatory approaches and environmental justice noted in the paper are all relevant to grassroots women.

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
This paper is somewhat of relevance to grassroots woman, considering it covers issues related to gender inequality to some extent. Marginalization and vulnerability for women have come up in discussion, although not as a major focus.

Alejandro de Castro Mazarro, Columbia University
There is a reference to WIEGO in the paper, but mentioning women's role in Key Drivers for Action, would be essential.

Ann Wanjiru, GROOTS Kenya
It is relevant to grassroots women on a collective level as women stand to benefit from any positive transformation in the community

E. Engendering the New Urban Agenda

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
On a general note, this paper addresses driving actions such as Recognition of the informal settlement and Government Leadership and so on. Also, there are other issues like development of participatory planning and integration of people and systems. These sectors, if elaborated, would surely involve gender equality factors and how they can contribute to a non-gender biased socio- economic state. These, according to me would play very important roles in formation of upcoming urban agendas.

Alejandro de Castro Mazarro, Columbia University
Including the role and potential of women's collective action at "Key drivers for action"

Ann Wanjiru, GROOTS Kenya
Through greater participation of grassroots women and women leaders in policy framing and other decision making processes

F. Strengths and weaknesses, editorial comments

Joyce Yu, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board

It misses the opportunity to go one step further in noting empowering communities as one of the critical Drivers. It diverts to ALL stakeholders which waters it down. But does note that local knowledge and expertise should be valued, etc.

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
If we look at informal settlement as topic of generalized discussion, this paper has covered issues, which can be focused on. But there is not one sector that has been elaborated, or addressed to a specific group as a target. One of the major key factor I found is Participatory planning, which could have been more detailed and that, in the process, would have also highlighted gender inequality issues.

Alejandro de Castro Mazarro, Columbia University
The Figures and Key Facts are overly optimistic. In particular, Key fact #5 (proportion of slum dwellers is declining) suggests thinking that slums are a declining reality, while the truth is that number of slum dwellers are increasing (See UN World Cities Report 2010). This information could be added to key fact #7. Key fact #4 overlaps with Main Concept #1. The relationship between informal settlements and slums should be clarified a bit more, so the terms don't appear as exchangeable.

G. General suggestions and commentary

Joyce Yu, Huairou Commission Global Advisory Board
Some stats on women's morbidity and health status in informal settlements would improve impact of poor living conditions and position women's needs more clearly. Some stats on domestic violence and rape would dramaticise how serious this issue is for any progress on slum upgrading to occur.

Sonia Islam, Reincarnation (Bangladesh)
Since, we are focusing on Women's empowerment as an agenda, this paper, although briefed, has details on women participation missing in the write up. The key drivers for action have nowhere mentioned how participatory planning can involve women as an important actor. However, a summary can be drawn as this being informative about how informal settlements are interpreted and what could be the ways to stabilize or upgrade them.

Alejandro de Castro Mazarro, Columbia University
There is a very important issue in this paper, which limits the usefulness of the issue paper. While Main Concepts, Figures and Key Factors very well identify the social causes that provoke slums, the Issue Summary and Key Drivers for Action are mostly related to housing or physical planning needs. This is a conceptual important mistake because part of the root problems at informal settlements lie at formal settlements: underpaid jobs, and lack of redistributing justice, in particular in regards to the allocation of urban land to slum dwellers. Density of slum areas often doubles the one from formal areas, and solutions to provide land to slum dwellers leads often to build housing in segregated areas. Providing housing and regularizing land titling does not need to solve problems related to exclusion, and in this sense the issue paper is not connecting root causes of slums, to solutions. The Participatory Slum Upgrading mentioned pays no full respect to the figures and key

facts (especially #2) nor to Main Concept "Socio-Spatial Regulation." The issue paper reports on what has been done in the last 20 years, but does not fully reports what are the issues for the next 20 years.

Ann Wanjiru, GROOTS Kenya
Proper plans to mitigate on this point ---- Accurate and available informal settlement and slum data, learning platforms and knowledge sharing across all scales, remain limited and ad hoc.